

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

7 June 2016 | 3.30pm – 5.30pm | Meeting No. 5/2016

Meeting location: *RSPO Secretariat Office, 37 Floor, Menara UOA, Bangsar, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia*

GENERAL MEETING AGENDA

List of Complaint Panel members

Melizel Asuncion (Verite), Henry Barlow (Affiliate Member), Michelle Desilets (Orangutan Land Trust), Matthias Diemer (WWF Switzerland), Bambang Dwilaksono (First Resources), Marieke Leegwater (Solidaridad), Sabarinah Marzuky (Sime Darby), John Payne (Borneo Rhino Alliance), Priya Gopalan (UBS AG), Frasier Lanier (Citibank), Tom McLaughlin (Woolworths), Lim Sian Choo (Bumitama), Lanash Tanda (SEPA).

3.30pm – 4.20pm

1. Opening Remarks by Chairperson
2. Declaration of Conflict of Interest
3. To confirm and adopt the minutes of the 28 April 2016 Complaints Panel Meeting
4. New Complaints
5. New reported cases
6. Monthly Update: List of Complaints and Reported cases
7. Any other matters
8. Golden Veroleum Liberia

Group 1: 4.20pm- 4.50pm

1. Agropalma SA
2. PT Sawit Mandiri Lestari/ PT Sawit Sumbermas Sarana (PT SML/PT SSS)
3. PT Limpah Sejahtera (First Resources Ltd)
4. Orang Dusun Lahad Datu/ FELDA

Group 2: 4.50pm – 5.30pm

5. PT Sisirau/Ibris Palm Group
6. PT Permata Hijau Pasaman (PHP) 1 (Wilmar International)
7. Equatorial Palm Oil / KLK
8. PT Nubika Jaya / Permata Hijau Group
9. Plantaciones de Pucallpa SAC
10. FELDA Global Venture
11. Extractora La Gloria SAS – Colombia
12. PT Bumitama Gunajaya Agro / Bumitama

Group 3: 5.30 – 6.00pm

13. PT London Sumatra (Lonsum)
14. Golden Veroleum Liberia (GVL)
15. PT Kartika Prima Cipta/ Golden Agri Resource (GAR)
16. PT Sawit Nabati Agro/ PT Sukses Karya Sawit/ PT Berkat Nabati Sawit/ PT Bumi Sawit Sejahtera (IOI Group) –Ketapang
17. Poligrow – Colombia

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

7 June 2016 | 3.30pm – 5.30pm | Meeting No. 5/2016

Meeting location: *RSPO Secretariat Office, 37 Floor, Menara UOA, Bangsar, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia*

Agenda item
<p>1. Opening Remarks by Chairperson</p> <p>The Chair opened the meeting by welcoming everybody and then invited everyone to scrutinize the minutes of the previous meeting.</p>
<p>2. “No Conflict of Interest”</p> <p>Two members had a conflict of interest in 4 of the cases/complaints being reported or deliberated. They will abstain from taking part in the deliberation and decision in those cases.</p>
<p>3. Minutes of the meeting of 28 April 2016</p> <p>The minutes of the meeting were adopted and confirmed by the members unanimously.</p>
<p>4. New Complaints</p> <p>i. New - Palma Tica SA in Costa Rica/ Compania Industrial Aceitera Coto 54 S. - 24 May 2016</p> <p>A group of smallholders Asociación e Palmicultores del Sur (ASOPASUR) in Punta raena are complaining against Palma Tica, saying that they are not being paid fair prices by the company for their FFB. The farmers claims that there is no transparency or clarity in the way the prices are arrived at. Alleged breach of Criterion 1.1: Commitment to Transparency and Criterion 6.10: Growers and mills deal fairly and transparently with smallholder and other local businesses. Currently, we are awaiting reply from the member.</p> <p>ii. Delicia BV /IOI 12 Apr 2016</p> <p>Delicia is a customer of the IOI group (Loders Croklaan). We were informed by IOI on 25/03/2016 about their upcoming suspension by RSPO on 01/04/2016. We did not get any information from RSPO itself until the RSPO Gazette of 05/04/2016.</p> <p>The short notice of the suspension of the IOI group has a disproportionate effect on Delicia. There is too little time to switch to other suppliers. Other than that, alternative raw materials (CBE's) have not been tested and tests take at least 6 months to provide reliable information on stability.</p> <p>This way of sanctioning IOI is not only effecting IOI, but also Delicia and Delicia's customers. We consider this not acceptable, and ask you to evaluate the penalties in your system in such a way that only the offender is affected.</p> <p>Status: Box A – complaint case received</p> <p>Update: RSPO Secretariat has sent letter on 25 April 2016. The reply has been received, RSPO Secretariat to share the letter with the Complaints Panel and wait for their response.</p> <p>iii. Morning foods/RSPO 1 April 2016</p> <p>We have received a new complaint from this customer of IOI against the RSPO. Saying that suspension of IOI has disrupted their operations as their supply comes from IOI Loders Croklaan. They cannot find alternate suppliers.</p> <p><i>‘We have done nothing wrong, but we are being penalised by the RSPO actions on this matter. We note that there has been no communication from the RSPO on this matter and no announcement of any sort on the RSPO website. The actions of the RSPO in this whole group suspension of IOI are not reasonable or</i></p>

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

7 June 2016 | 3.30pm – 5.30pm | Meeting No. 5/2016

Meeting location: *RSPO Secretariat Office, 37 Floor, Menara UOA, Bangsar, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia*

proportionate. The lack of communication from the RSPO on this issue, and the almost immediate timescale of the IOI suspension, has given us no opportunity to react and source alternative material, or for the wider supply chain to adapt to the new situation. We would like this to be considered as a formal complaint against the RSPO.'

Status: Box A – Complaint case received

Update: RSPO Secretariat has sent letter on 25 April 2016. Currently waiting for reply.

4. New Reported Cases

The following are reported cases received by the RSPO Secretariat which have not yet been deliberated by the Complaints Panel.

i. New – PT Nabire Baru / Goodhope – filed by Yayasan PUSAKA on 19 April 2016

Allegations:

- i. Land grabbing of the indigenous people of Yerisiam.
- ii. Violence and involvement of Brimob (police mobile brigade)
- iii. Deforestation that causing the flood in Village Sima, the place of Yerisiam tribe.
- iv. The company has destroy the sacred place and Dusun Sagu (the source of main food of Yerisiam tribe).

The complainant requested RSPO to:

- Do the ground checking
- Request PT Nabire Baru to compensate and stop their activity, unless they got consent from Yerisiam.

Status: Box A. Reported case received.

Update: Physical meeting with the company conducted on 17 of May 2016 – the company gave clarification for each allegation and also furnished complete evidence. RSPO Secretariat to arrange meeting with the complainant at the end of June.

ii. PT Bumi Pratama Khatulistiwa/Wilmar International – filed by Link-Ar Borneo on 3 March 2016

It is alleged that PT BPK, has polluted the Malaya river by disposing empty fruit bunches that caused flood every rainy season. The company also does not provide any CSR program to the community of Malaya Village.

The complainant demand the company to:

- Stop disposing empty fruit bunches to the river
- Perform regular and sustainable maintenance to Malaya River
- Provide CSR program to improve the infrastructure and other social needs
- To be transparent in the CSR financial management in accordance with Government Regulation No.47/2012.

Status: Box A – reported case received

Update: Both parties agreed to have a follow-up meeting in 21 May 2016. RSPO to wait for the result of that meeting.

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

7 June 2016 | 3.30pm – 5.30pm | Meeting No. 5/2016

Meeting location: *RSPO Secretariat Office, 37 Floor, Menara UOA, Bangsar, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia*

iii. **Supply chain case** Musim Mas & Wilmar International – lodged by Walhi Jambi & Jaringan Masyarakat Gambut Jambi (JMG-J) on 15 February 2016

Musim Mas buys FFB from PT Bukit Bintang Sawit (PT BBS) which is non RSPO member. PT BBS has a land dispute with the communities in 3 villages, namely Desa Seponjen, Sogo dan Tanjung in District Muaro Jambi, Indonesia.

Status: Box A – reported case received

Update: RSPO Secretariat has sent a formal letter to the complainant saying that we have a limited authority to handle cases against a non-member of RSPO. We have done enough and both Musim Mas and Wilmar had shown commitment to make sure that they do not breach any of the RSPO rules in their dealings with PT BBS. RSPO Secretariat to close the case

iv. **Supply Chain case** - PT Anugerah Energitama, supplier of Golden Agri Resources/GAR & PT Gawi Makmur Kalimantan/Wings Agro - filed by Centre for Orangutan Protection/COP on 14 March 2016

GAR & PT Gawi Makmur Kalimantan, a subsidiary of Wingsagro, are the supply chain of PT Anugerah Energitama, a non-member of RSPO. COP found 13 Orangutans - 2 of them are babies, inside the concession of PT AE. Other endangered species like *Hylobates muelleri* and *Hornbills* were also found nearby the concession.

Status: Box A - Reported Case Received

Update: 18 April 2016 – COP has sent a letter to BKSDA on their latest findings on PT AE's concession. They found 1 baby and 1 adult Orangutan during their visit 10 April and 16 April 2016 respectively. They requested BKSDA to take proactive action to save the Orangutans.

20 April 2016 – RSPO Secretariat has sent an email to GAR and Wings Agro informing them of the developments and the updates.

Currently, we are waiting for the companies to reply.

v. **Hap Seng Plantations Holdings Bhd, complaint filed by Sia Yi Chin of Lahad Datu Sabah on 11 November 2015**

The complainant is claiming that Hap Seng Plantations Holdings Bhd is illegally occupying his property (River Estates) of 6,454 acres in Lahad Datu, Sabah. He says that he is the beneficial owner of the said land and the land office in Kota Kinabalu has confirmed that the said land is still in his name as beneficial owner.

He has filed a civil suit against Hap Seng; originating summons: BKI-24-127/5 of 2012 filed on 30.07.2015.

Status: Box B. Complaint categorised

Update: RSPO Secretariat to wait for the court's decision.

vi. **PT Swadaya Multi Prakarsa (Batu Daya Village, Simpang Dua, Ketapang, West Kalimantan, Indonesia) a subsidiary of First Resources – lodged by Link-Ar Borneo on 11 May 2015.**

The allegations are :

- land clearing and plantation activities without Plantation Permit (IUP);
- land clearing by burning;
- land claim by community of Batu Daya including the plasma;

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

7 June 2016 | 3.30pm – 5.30pm | Meeting No. 5/2016

Meeting location: *RSPO Secretariat Office, 37 Floor, Menara UOA, Bangsar, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia*

- lack of FPIC.

Status: Box F. Action Plan

Update: RSPO Secretariat has received a report of the meeting between parties conducted on 19 of May. The company will have further socialization of the Batu Daya plasma scheme and make refinements on the communication with the community. RSPO Secretariat to monitor the progress.

5. Monthly List of Complaints (Status as of 1 May 2016)

Status	Number of Complaints	Number of Reported Cases
(A) Complaint received	1	1
(B) Complaint categorized	0	0
(C) Panel convened	0	0
(D) Complaint legitimate	9	0
(E) Reviewing response	3	0
(F) Action plan	5	2
(G) Case Closed for monitoring	7	2
(H) Case Closed	32	28
(I) Resubmission of complaint	0	0
(J) No case	0	5
(K) No response/ no action from member	0	0
(L) Termination	0	0
(M) panel decision disputed	0	0
(N) Non cooperation	1	0
(O) No consent on action plan	0	0
(P) Appeal	1	0
(Q) Not resolved	3	0
TOTAL	62	38
TOTAL OPEN CASES	19	3

On 1 May 2016, a total of 19 ongoing complaint cases were deliberated and 3 reported cases were recorded.

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

7 June 2016 | 3.30pm – 5.30pm | Meeting No. 5/2016

Meeting location: RSPO Secretariat Office, 37 Floor, Menara UOA, Bangsar, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia

6. Any other matters for the Complaints Panel:

6.1 Dates for the next Complaints Panel Meetings

- i. The suggested of the upcoming CP meeting dates for 2016 are as follows:

May	June	July	Aug	Sept	Oct	Nov	Dec
18/05*	7/06**	25/07	22/08	20/09	20/10	07/11***	19/12

*) 18 May CP meeting has been postponed to 7th of June

**) TBD the alternative dates of the meeting will be circulated after the meeting

The EU RT will be held on 9 June in Milan. The meeting will be held back to back with the Board meeting on 8 June 2016.

***) The RT 14 is confirmed to be held on 7 - 10 November 2016 in Shangri-La Hotel, Bangkok. Secretariat will advise the time and venue after the details formally announced.

6.2 General Information

- i. The minutes of the 28 April 2016 CP meeting will be published on the RSPO website on 20 May 2016.

6.3 Complaints System Revamp

- i. RSPO Secretariat has compiled all responses and feedback received during the Integrated Complaints System public consultation. The result has been sent to the consultant for further processing.

6.4 Membership of Complaints Panel

- i. RSPO Complaints Panel welcomed Priya Gopalan from UBS and Lim Sian Choo from Bumitama as new members of the Complaints Panel, effective June 2016.
- ii. Secretariat to draft the SOP regarding the recruitment of new CP members.

6.5 Membership Suspension and Certification suspension

- i. Felda Global Ventures Holdings Berhad (FGV) and Lembaga Felda (The FELDA Group), have requested for an immediate withdrawal of RSPO P&C certificates of its 58 mills located throughout Malaysia. The withdrawal of FGV's certificates is effective as of 3rd May 2016.
- ii. Regarding the reported cases in Kalimantan, Felda is currently addressing it and will make a public statement on the matter.
- iii. RSPO Secretariat to publish the information on the reported case on the website.

7. Golden Veroleum Liberia

- i. During the meeting, of 4th June 2015, it was decided that the 'Butaw incident' will be treated as a separate issue from the main complaint.
- ii. A meeting took place on 5 August 2015, and the next meeting was scheduled on 24th August 2015.
- iii. The Panel stressed the need to reach a balanced decision to address all the issues leading to an amicable solution to multiple issues.

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

7 June 2016 | 3.30pm – 5.30pm | Meeting No. 5/2016

Meeting location: *RSPO Secretariat Office, 37 Floor, Menara UOA, Bangsar, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia*

- iv. The Impacts Team has sent out emails to stakeholders on the meeting in Liberia in September 2015 on the establishment of a pilot initiative for a National Advisory Committee on Oil Palm in Liberia.
- v. On 26th September 2015, the Impacts Team presented the decision of the Complaints Panel to the stakeholders in Monrovia, Liberia.
- vi. On 26 October 2015, GVL sent their response to the decision of the CP dated 19 September 2015.
- vii. On 16 November, the Complaints Panel decided that the ‘stop work order’ may be lifted after GVL renegotiate the FPIC from the communities in Butaw.
- viii. 8 December 2015, GVL asked for a lifting of the Stop Work Order, as they claimed it was at the request of the community. The RSPO Secretariat to draft the letter and circulate it to the Complaints Panel members for review.
- ix. The letter was sent to GVL on 21 Dec 2015 and conditions for the lifting of the “stop work order’ were specified in it.
- x. We are waiting for the response from the complainants.
- xi. The Meeting took place on 11 April 2016 but information still pending from GVL and the NGO. Next meeting scheduled for 19 May 2016.

DELIBERATION OF COMPLAINTS

Complaint 1	
Member Organization	Agropalma SA
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Brazil
Complainant	José Maria Tabaranã da Costa and Aida Raimunda Maia da Costa
Date filed	13 August 2015
Nature of complaint	That Agropalma has acquired land and planted oil palm in violation of the RSPO Principles and Criteria
Status	Box G- Closed for Monitoring
Decision /Justification	RSPO Secretariat to wait for the decision from court and to close the case for monitoring

Complaint 2	
Member Organisation	PT Sawit Mandiri Lestari /PT Sawit Sumbermas Sarana (PT SSS)
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia, Lamandau, Central Kalimantan
Complainant	Environmental Investigation Agency (EIA) and Jaringan Pemantau Independen

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

7 June 2016 | 3.30pm – 5.30pm | Meeting No. 5/2016

Meeting location: *RSPO Secretariat Office, 37 Floor, Menara UOA, Bangsar, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia*

	Kehutanan Kalimantan Tengah (JPIK Kalteng)
Date filed	5 June 2015
Nature of complaint	<p>Category : FPIC related issues (C2.3, C6.4)</p> <p>The Greenomics report of June 2015 says, PT SSS continues to actively clear forested peatland including orang-utan habitat. Following the NPP of PT SSS for public comment on 12 March 2015, the allegation from EIA is that there have been major flaws of HCV assessment and SEIA conducted by PT. Sonokeling, which covered:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Consultations with communities did not take place as described in the NPP documents and affected communities did not participate in the HCV assessment and SEIA; 2. HCV assessment is technically flawed; 3. No FPIC process in place; 4. The AMDAL process was not carried out in accordance with the law; 5. PT SMP has not yet obtained permits that are a prerequisite to land clearing.
Status	Box H – Case Closed
Decision /Justification	RSPO Secretariat has sent the closure letter to the company on 24 May 2016. The case is now fully closed.

Complaint 3	
Member Organization	PT Limpah Sejahtera (a subsidiary of First Resources Ltd (FRI))
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Yayasan International Animal Rescue Indonesia (YIARI)
Date filed	1 May 2010
Nature of complaint	<p>Violation of RSPO P&C 5.2 and P&C 7.3.</p> <p>The company is alleged to have breached:</p> <p>Principle 5: Environmental responsibility and conservation of natural resources and biodiversity</p> <p>Principle 7: Responsible development of new plantings.</p> <p>The company is alleged to have destroyed Orangutan habitats and not to have carried out an HCV assessment before development of the plantation.</p>
Status	Box F – Action Plan
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to scrutinise the map from WRI and see to check if it is adequate and whether if the company has followed the liability procedure.

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

7 June 2016 | 3.30pm – 5.30pm | Meeting No. 5/2016

Meeting location: *RSPO Secretariat Office, 37 Floor, Menara UOA, Bangsar, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia*

Complaint 4	
Member Organization	FELDA (Federal Land development Authority) FELDA Ventures Bhd.
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Malaysia
Complainant	Orang Dusun Lahad Datu (Desa Begahak)
Date filed	16 February 2015
Nature of complaint	<p>According to the Enquiry National Hak Tanah document by SUHAKAM, the state government had given 1260 acres of land to the Dusun Begahak community in 1981. At the same time, the same land was alienated to FELDA for development.</p> <p>The complainant raised the issue that FELDA has no right to develop their land and should return it to the community because the land originally belonged to the community. The complainant also stated that the cemetery area is being developed by FELDA.</p> <p>Felda encloved 916 acres of the said land and gave it back to the community. The community planted fruits and other crops on the land.</p> <p>A police report has been made by the community and that is the source of the complaint.</p>
Status	Box D – Complaints legitimate
Decision /Justification	RSPO Secretariat to wait for the results of the mapping exercise by the state Land and Survey Department.

Complaint 5	
Member Organization	PT Sisirau/Ibris Palm Group
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Sumatran Orangutan Society (SOS)
Date filed	29 October 2012
Nature of complaint	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Clearing of HCV land containing Orangutan habitats 2. Failing to stop work after the discovery of Orangutans 3. Breach of New Planting Procedures
Status	Box N - Non Cooperation
Decision /Justification	<p>Secretariat to write to the company, asking whether they are able to send the concession map, and also seeks clarification from the Indonesian Growers Caucus and Technical Department of RSPO on the legality of submitting concession maps to RSPO.</p> <p>Regarding the withdrawal of PanEco, we should write back to them saying that we accept the resignation with regret.</p>

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

7 June 2016 | 3.30pm – 5.30pm | Meeting No. 5/2016

Meeting location: *RSPO Secretariat Office, 37 Floor, Menara UOA, Bangsar, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia*

Complaint 6	
Member Organization	PT Permata Hijau Pasaman (PHP) 1 –Wilmar International
Membership category	Palm Oil Processors and/or Traders
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	S.H Gampo Alam, <i>Pucuk Adat Nagari Kapa</i> (indigenous leader of Nagari Kapa) as well as Head of <i>Kerapatan Adat Nagari Kapa</i> (KAN – a village/nagari-level customary institution in Minangkabau which maintains and preserves the Minangkabau customs and culture). Supported by Forest People Programme (FPP) and HuMa (Association for Community and Ecology-Based Law Reform)
Date filed	30 October 2014
Nature of complaint	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Complainant seeks clarity of the extent of PT. PHP 1's nucleus estate in Nagari Kapa. 2. Complainant rejects PT. PHP 1's application to the National Land Agency for a Hak Guna Usaha (HGU) certificate over the customary (<i>ulayat</i>) land of Nagari Kapa. 3. Violation of RSPO Principles & Criteria 6.2 – community did not participate in decision making on the areas to set aside as HCV areas. 4. Complainant seeks clarification to whom will the land be reverted at the end of the HGU period?
Status	Box D – Complaint Legitimate
Decision /Justification	RSPO Secretariat to send formal letter to the complainant to clarify on the sharing of costs for ground verification exercise to be undertaken by the independent consultant.

Complaint 7	
Member Organization	Equatorial Palm Oil PLC
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Liberia
Complainant	Sustainable Development Institute
Date filed	25 September 2013
Nature of complaint	<p>It is alleged that the company has cleared and planted on land that is the customary land of the community in New Cess, Grand Bassa County, Liberia; and is seeking to expand the plantation without the free, prior and informed consent of the communities.</p> <p>The community is also objecting to the company carrying out a re-survey of the</p>

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

7 June 2016 | 3.30pm – 5.30pm | Meeting No. 5/2016

Meeting location: *RSPO Secretariat Office, 37 Floor, Menara UOA, Bangsar, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia*

	existing concession area. The company is alleged to have breached Principle 2.2 & 2.3 of FPIC and Principle 7: Responsible development of new plantings. No NPP notification posted to RSPO.
Status	Box G – Closed for monitoring
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to close the case for monitoring after the company has sent its last progress report in Late June 2016.

Complaint 8	
Member Organisation	PT Nubika Jaya / Permata Hijau Group
Membership category	Oil Palm Growers
Country	Indonesia, Labuhan Batu Selatan, North Sumatra
Complainant	NGO Masyarakat Peduli Lingkungan Hidup Labusel (MPLH Labusel)
Date filed	9 June 2015
Nature of complaint	Category : River pollution (C4.3, C4.4, C5.1, C5.3) Allegations : PT Nubika Jaya (oil palm mill) has polluted the river, Aek Baba. Community cannot use the river for bathing and washing. In May 2012, some of the fish breeders found thousands of fish dead in the dike located in the Hamlet of Karang Sari, Village Sisumut, along Aek Baba. Flooding contaminated with waste also occurred in the same village in 2012.
Status	Box H – The case closed
Decision /Justification	Secretariat has sent the closure letter on 29 April 2016. The case is now fully closed.

Complaint 9	
Member Organization	Plantaciones de Pucallpa SAC
Membership category	Grower
Country	Peru
Complainant	Forest People Program (FPP)
Date filed	5 December 2016
Nature of complaint	Plantaciones de Pucallpa SAC has been accused of human rights violation by the Shipibo community of Santa Clara de Uchunya. In so doing, Plantaciones de Pucallpa has been alleged to have breached the Principles and Criteria of the RSPO on land acquisition and the conservation of forest. These allegations were made in a forum in London; please see link below.

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

7 June 2016 | 3.30pm – 5.30pm | Meeting No. 5/2016

Meeting location: *RSPO Secretariat Office, 37 Floor, Menara UOA, Bangsar, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia*

	http://www.globalresearch.ca/illegal-deforestation-of-5000-hectares-of-peru-amazon-for-palm-oil-peruvian-indigenous-leader/5486126
Status	Box C. Panel Convened
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to wait for a full report from WRI and the response from the complainant

Complaint 10	
Member Organization	FELDA
Membership category	Grower
Country	Malaysia
Complainant	Article by The Wall Street Journal
Date filed	26 July 2015
Nature of complaint	<p><i>“Palm-Oil Migrant Workers Tell of Abuses on Malaysian Plantations Global palm-oil industry contributes to human trafficking, rights advocates say”.</i></p> <p><i>The palm-oil plantations of Malaysia have become magnets for refugees from Bangladesh and Myanmar. Many have complained of onerous working conditions and few legal protections.</i></p> <p><i>Syed Zain Al-Mahmood/The Wall Street Journal.</i></p> <p>The issues including human trafficking, general poor labour conditions, Use of labour contractors, to exploit illegal immigrants from Bangladesh and Myanmar; Withholding of passports; Poor health care; Pay below minimum wages; Non-payment of wages; Bonded labourers.</p>
Status	Box F. Action Plan
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to circulate the revised action plan to CP members for review

Complaint 11	
Member Organization	Extractora La Gloria SAS
Membership category	Grower
Country	Colombia
Complainant	Fredy Antonio Corrales, representative of the Colombian Association for Displaced Peoples’ Prospects (ASOCOL), Adelfo Segundo Rodríguez, representative of the Association of Returning Displaced Farmers (ASOCADAR), Senator Iván Cepeda, Senator Alberto Castilla, and Representative Alirio Uribe
Date filed	19 November 2015

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

7 June 2016 | 3.30pm – 5.30pm | Meeting No. 5/2016

Meeting location: *RSPO Secretariat Office, 37 Floor, Menara UOA, Bangsar, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia*

Nature of complaint	Extractora La Gloria SAS, in planting palm oil in the former Hacienda Bellacruz- today Hacienda La Gloria- occupies 9,000 hectares in the municipalities of La Gloria, Pelaya and Tamalameque, in southern Cesar Department without following RSPO rules. It does not comply with the following RSPO principles (1.1, 2.1, 2.2, 2.3, 4.5, 5.2, 6.4, 6.13)
Status	Box D Complaint legitimate
Decision /Justification	RSPO Secretariat to wait for response from the company to the preliminary decision.

Complaint 12	
Member Organization	Bumitama Gunajaya Agro/Bumitama
Membership category	Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Sawit Watch
Date filed	13 November 2016
Nature of complaint	<p>The allegations are:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Destroying graves and planting trees surrounding the graves; 2) Dispute on plasma scheme mechanism; 3) Termination of labourers and the status of labourer i.e. are they casual or permanent? 4) Compensation not paid directly to the land owner; 5) Loss of land certification and using the land of migrants which is still under control of the owner; 6) Criminalisation of Gusti Gelombang, a former Company Public Relation officer and now the Head of Cooperative Body. <p>This case has been handled bilaterally since 2014. It was escalated to RSPO because police came to Sawit Watch's office to arrest Gusti Gelombang, who was in their office at that time</p>
Status	Box D. Complaint Legitimate
Decision /Justification	<p>Secretariat to issue a letter informing the complainants that the main issues in the original complaint will be closed for monitoring.</p> <p>The new allegations on the plasma scheme and transparency of the koperasi's management issues shall remain open.</p> <p>Secretariat to facilitate a stakeholders meeting to see if the issues can be resolved via bilateral negotiations.</p>

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

7 June 2016 | 3.30pm – 5.30pm | Meeting No. 5/2016

Meeting location: *RSPO Secretariat Office, 37 Floor, Menara UOA, Bangsar, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia*

Complaint 13	
Member Organization	PT London Sumatra (Lonsum)
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Community of Desa Pergulaan via Sawit Watch
Date filed	7 April 2009
Nature of complaint	The following points were raised by the community of Desa Pergulaan: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Legality of the extension of the concession and demands for return of land totalling 165.6 ha. 2. The status of the law suit filed by 5 of the residents which is 'out-of-time' (compensation paid in 1971). 3. The legality of the security drain to prevent access. 4. Prohibiting cattle herding in the plantation. 5. The non-employment of residents of Desa Pergulaan in the plantation. 6. Failure by Lonsum to carry out Corporate Social Responsibility programs as promised. 7. No complaint letters have been addressed to Lonsum directly. 8. Status of residents on the Police 'Wanted List'.
Status	Box E – Reviewing Response
Decision /Justification	As advised by the Bupati of Serdang Bedagai, the community should send a letter to the Task Force set up by the government to settle the case. RSPO Secretariat to wait for the letter from the community.

Complaint 14	
Member Organization	Golden Veroleum Liberia (GVL)
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Liberia, Africa
Complainant	Green Advocates
Date filed	3 October 2012
Nature of complaint	Violation of the RSPO Principles and Criteria and New Plantings Procedure by: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Not providing public notification for a 30 day period consistent with the New Planting Procedures, 2) By commencing land preparation for new planting and infrastructure development prior to the expiry of the minimum 30-days consultation period. 3) By not conducting a comprehensive and participatory independent social and environmental impact assessment(s) of the area concerned and incorporating the

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

7 June 2016 | 3.30pm – 5.30pm | Meeting No. 5/2016

Meeting location: *RSPO Secretariat Office, 37 Floor, Menara UOA, Bangsar, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia*

	<p>results into relevant action plans (see RSPO criteria 5.1, 6.1, 7.1 & 7.4) including the identification of: (a) all primary forest, (b) any area required to maintain or enhance one or more High Conservation Values (HCVs), and (d) local peoples' land.</p> <p>4) Grabbing lands without respecting local customary rights and without the free, prior and informed consent (FPIC) of the customary land owners as represented through representative organizations of their choice (RSPO C2.2, C2.3, C7.5 and C7.6).</p> <p>5) Forcibly evicting the people from their lands (RSPO C7.5 and C7.6).</p>
Status	<p>Box G (Monitoring progress of action plan for Complaint 1 by Green Advocates)</p> <p>Box D – Panel has made a preliminary decision for Complaints 2 to 9.</p>
Decision /Justification	<p>The stop work order in Butaw remains, while on the others, GVL shall continue to implement the action plan</p>

Complaint 15	
Member Organization	PT Kartika Prima Cipta/ Golden Agri Resource (GAR)
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Forest People Programme (FPP) and Transformasi untuk Keadilan (TUK) Indonesia
Date filed	14 October 2014
Nature of complaint	<p>Points raised :</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. PT. KPC is in persistent violation of the RSPO P&C pertaining to HCV assessment, the recognition of customary land rights and free, prior, and informed consent (FPIC). Lack of FPIC of the local Dayak and Malay people during the acquisition of the land. 2. Land was acquired without a land tenure study and participatory mapping. 3. Late HCV assessment which was done by Institute Pertanian Bogor, final consultation was on May 2014. 4. Dissatisfaction among smallholders and resentment because of reduced land set aside for plasma compared to HCV areas. 5. Land has been set aside as HCS area that made no provision for customary land uses and tenure and local peoples' livelihood. 6. GAR as the parent company of all 18 subsidiaries listed is acting in violation of the New Planting Procedures (NPP) by submitting information which it knows is false. No HGU exists in 16 of the 18 concessions where NPP was submitted.
Status	Box D – Complaint Legitimate
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to wait for the results of legal review from the consultant

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

7 June 2016 | 3.30pm – 5.30pm | Meeting No. 5/2016

Meeting location: *RSPO Secretariat Office, 37 Floor, Menara UOA, Bangsar, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia*

Complaint 16	
Member Organization	PT Sawit Nabati Agro/ PT Sukses Karya Sawit/ PT Berkat Nabati Sawit/ PT Bumi Sawit Sejahtera (IOI Group) –Ketapang
Membership category	Oil Palm Growers
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	AidEnvironment
Date filed	3 April 2015
Nature of complaint	Issues raised by AidEnvironment: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. 10,000 ha of planting without permit (IUP) b. Encroachment into the forest sanctuary c. IOI has cleared the land without submitting NPP.
Status	Box N – Non Cooperation.
Decision /Justification	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> – To review the quarterly progress report of 25th of June 2016, once it is received and decide on the suspension lifting issue – To consider the possibility for asking for 2005 LUCA peer review.

Complaint 17	
Member Organization	Poligrow Colombia
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Colombia
Complainant	Environmental Investigation Agency
Date filed	13 August 2015
Nature of complaint	The Italian-owned Poligrow Ltd, has prohibited the Jiw and Sikuaní indigenous communities from freedom of movement. The EIA's video alleged abuses by RSPO's Italian member in Colombia
Status	Box D – Complaints Legitimate
Decision /Justification	To allow for the independent investigation to take place, prior to any decision from the Complaints Panel.