

## COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

*For Website*

7 November 2016 | 2.30pm – 7.30pm | Meeting No. 11/2016

Meeting location: *Singapore Room, Shangri La Hotel, Bangkok - Thailand*

### GENERAL MEETING AGENDA

#### List of Complaint Panel members

Melizel Asuncion (Verite), Henry Barlow (Affiliate Member), Michelle Desilets (Orangutan Land Trust), Matthias Diemer (WWF Switzerland), Bambang Dwilaksono (First Resources), Marieke Leegwater (Solidaridad), Sabarinah Marzuky (Sime Darby), John Payne (Borneo Rhino Alliance), Priya Gopalan (UBS AG), Frasier Lanier (Citibank), Tom McLaughlin (Woolworths), Lim Sian Choo (Bumitama), Lanash Tanda (SEPA), Robert Kruger (RKG).

#### 3.30pm – 4.20pm

1. Opening Remarks by Chairperson
2. Declaration of Conflict of Interest
3. To confirm and adopt the minutes of the 20 October 2016 Complaints Panel Meeting
4. New Complaints
5. Reported cases
6. Monthly Update: List of Complaints and Reported cases
7. Golden Veroleum Liberia
8. Sale of concessions/subsidiaries with complaints by members

#### Group 1: 4.20pm- 4.50pm

1. Agropalma SA
2. PT Limpah Sejahtera (First Resources Ltd)
3. Orang Dusun Lahad Datu/ FELDA
4. Palma Tica SA
5. Hap Seng Plantations Holdings Bhd

#### Group 2: 4.50pm – 5.30pm

6. PT Sisirau/Ibris Palm Group
7. PT Permata Hijau Pasaman (PHP) 1/ Wilmar International
8. Equatorial Palm Oil / KLK
9. Plantaciones de Pucallpa SAC
10. FELDA Global Venture
11. Extractora La Gloria SAS
12. PT Bumitama Gunajaya Agro / Bumitama

#### Group 3: 5.30 – 6.00pm

13. PT London Sumatra (Lonsum) / Sawit Watch
14. Golden Veroleum Liberia (GVL)
15. PT Kartika Prima Cipta/ Golden Agri Resource (GAR)
16. PT Sawit Nabati Agro/ PT Sukses Karya Sawit/ PT Berkat Nabati Sawit/ PT Bumi Sawit Sejahtera / IOI Group
17. Poligrow Colombia Ltda
18. PT PP London Sumatra (Lonsum)/RAN, OPPUK & ILRF

## COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

7 November 2016 | 2.30pm – 7.30pm | Meeting No. 11/2016

Meeting location: Singapore Room, Shangri La Hotel, Bangkok - Thailand

Agenda item
<p><b>1. Opening Remarks by Chairperson</b></p> <p>The Chair opened the meeting by welcoming everybody and then invited everyone to scrutinize the minutes of the previous meeting.</p>
<p><b>2. “No Conflict of Interest”</b></p> <p>None of the CP members’ declared his/her any new “conflict of interest” in the cases being deliberated.</p>
<p><b>3. Minutes of the meeting of 20 October 2016</b></p> <p>The minutes of the meeting were adopted and confirmed by the members unanimously.</p>
<p><b>4. Reported Cases</b></p> <p>The following are reported cases received by the RSPO Secretariat, which have not been deliberated by the Complaints Panel.</p> <p><b>i. PT Bumi Sawit Kencana II/Wilmar International Ltd. – filed by the community of Kapuk Village on 22 July 2016</b></p> <p>The community of Kapuk Village demanded the company to give compensation on 78 Ha of land owned by the Farmers Group.</p> <p><b>Status:</b> Box B – Reported case categorized.</p> <p><b>ii. PT Bumi Sawit Kencana/Wilmar International – filed by the Farmer Group of Pantap Village on 27 July 2016</b></p> <p>It is alleged that the company:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Has not paid compensation for 1.482,90 Ha land of which 0. 33 Ha land (owned by Mr. Simamora) should have been enslaved.</li> <li>- Has not developed plasma for the local community.</li> <li>- The waste from the mills flows into the river during the rainy season, causing floods.</li> <li>- CSR, as promised, has not been implemented in 2016.</li> </ul> <p><b>Status:</b> Box B – complaint categorized</p> <p><b>iii. PT Mustika Sembuluh/Wilmar International – filed by the Farmers Group of Pondok Damar on 18 July 2016</b></p> <p>It is alleged that the mill has polluted the Sei Sampit river (P&amp;C 5.3).</p> <p><b>Status:</b> Box B – complaint categorized</p> <p><b>iv. PT Karunia Kencana Permai Sejati (PT KKPS II &amp; KKPS III) /Wilmar International – filed by the community of Desa Tangar on 19 July 2016</b></p> <p>It is alleged that the company:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- has not paid compensation on 1.099 Ha land to the Farmers Group of Berkat Harapan and Lampung Tarung</li> <li>- The company has not developed plasma for the local community.</li> </ul> <p><b>Status:</b> Box B – complaint categorized</p> <p><b>Update for reported cases a - d:</b></p> <p><b>7 November 2016</b> – A meeting with the company is scheduled on 8 November 2016. Secretariat to wait for the result of the meeting.</p>

## COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

7 November 2016 | 2.30pm – 7.30pm | Meeting No. 11/2016

Meeting location: *Singapore Room, Shangri La Hotel, Bangkok - Thailand*

### v. **PT Bumi Sawit Sejahtera (PT BSS), SNA Group /IOI – filed by the community of Natai Kuini, West Kalimantan on 6 June 2016**

The allegations were filed against two managers of PT BSS :

- The managers issued a false report on planting since January 2015. Even though the reports were issued, the planting has not started until now.
- Land clearing by burning
- Planted on the HCS areas
- The maintenance of the planted areas are not conducted properly and caused a loss in the use of seeds and fertilizers.

Currently, the community has blockaded the roads within the concession including some company assets. The community requested IOI to conduct an audit and field verification of PT BSS's concession and to dismiss the two managers.

**Status:** Box H. Case Closed.

#### **Update:**

**1 November 2016** – No feedback received from the complainant. Secretariat has sent closure letter to the company and complainant. The case is now closed.

### vi. **PT Nabire Baru / Goodhope – filed by Yayasan PUSAKA on 19 April 2016**

Allegations:

- i. Land grabbing from the indigenous people of Yerisiam.
- ii. Violence and involvement of Brimob (police mobile brigade)
- iii. Deforestation that is causing floods in Village Sima, the home village of the Yerisiam tribe.
- iv. The company has destroyed sacred places and Dusun Sagu (the source of main food of Yerisiam tribe).

The complainant requested RSPO to:

- Do the ground verification of the allegations
- Request PT Nabire Baru to compensate and stop their activity, unless they got the consent from the Yerisiam.

**Status:** Box B. Reported case categorized.

#### **Update:**

1. **19 October 2016** - The company had a meeting with the NGO Pusaka and FPP. Next steps from the meeting: Yayasan Pusaka and the company have developed mutual understandings on the issues and agreed to amicably address the case, both Yayasan Pusaka and the company agreed to address the complaints through direct communication and engagement among local community groups and between the community and the company to be facilitated by Yayasan Pusaka. Also, the RSPO team has visited the site to meet with concerned stakeholders for facts finding and thinks that the case can be resolved directly between the company and the community. The RSPO Complaints Panel, however, is expected to maintain oversight of the complaint and allow the parties to share communications with the RSPO. As reiterated by Pak Franki, the main cause of the complaints are communication gaps between the company and local community and among local community groups. So, both parties agreed to work very closely to bridge the

## COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

7 November 2016 | 2.30pm – 7.30pm | Meeting No. 11/2016

Meeting location: Singapore Room, Shangri La Hotel, Bangkok - Thailand

gap between the company and the community and between the disputed sections of the community and continue to monitor the negotiation process among Sima villagers and implementation of the agreement. The company highlighted that because it is stemming from ill-motive complaints coming from a family with past bad records were not immediately heeded. We accept that it was an oversight from the company as good facts were hidden inside fabricated and false facts. The company also request -as remarked both by Pak Sanjaya and Pak Ratha- that both parties agreed to resolve genuine complaints from the community, but will not entertain ill-motive grievances or complaints about personal interest.

### 5. Monthly List of Complaints (Status as of 1 November 2016)

Status	Number of Complaints	Number of Reported Cases
(A) Complaint received	0	0
(B) Complaint categorized	1	5
(C) Panel convened	1	0
(D) Complaint legitimate	5	1
(E) Reviewing response	5	0
(F) Action plan	6	1
(G) Case Closed for monitoring	6	2
(H) Case Closed	36	32
(I) Resubmission of complaint	0	0
(J) No case	0	5
(K) No response/ no action from member	0	0
(L) Termination	0	0
(M) panel decision disputed	0	0
(N) Non cooperation	1	0
(O) No consent on action plan	0	0
(P) Appeal	0	0
(Q) Not resolved	3	0
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>64</b>	<b>46</b>
<b>TOTAL OPEN CASES</b>	<b>19</b>	<b>7</b>

On 1 November 2016, a total of 19 ongoing complaint cases were deliberated and 7 reported cases were recorded.

### 6. Any other matters for the Complaints Panel:

#### 6.1 Dates for the next Complaints Panel Meetings

- i. The upcoming CP meeting date: 19 December 2016

## COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

7 November 2016 | 2.30pm – 7.30pm | Meeting No. 11/2016

Meeting location: *Singapore Room, Shangri La Hotel, Bangkok - Thailand*

### 6.2 General Information

- i. The minutes of the 20 October 2016 CP meeting was published on the RSPO website on 8 November 2016.

### 6.3 Complaints System Revamp

- i. **1 November 2016** – Public Consultation on Complaints and Appeal Procedure has been published on RSPO website <http://www.rspo.org/news-and-events/announcements/public-consultation-rspo-complaints-and-appeals-procedure>. The public consultation will be opened for 30 days starting 1 November 2016 until including 1 December 2016.

### 6.4 Membership of Complaints Panel

- i. RSPO Secretariat welcomed a new member of the Complaints Panel, Robert Kruger from *Phatisa* based in South Africa. The member will be attending the regular meeting as an observer for 3 months.

## 7. Golden Veroleum Liberia

- i. During the meeting, of 4<sup>th</sup> June 2015, it was decided that the 'Butaw incident' will be treated as a separate issue from the main complaint.
- ii. A meeting took place on 5 August 2015, and the next meeting was scheduled on 24<sup>th</sup> August 2015.
- iii. The Panel stressed the need to reach a balanced decision to address all the issues leading to an amicable solution to multiple issues.
- iv. The Impacts Team has sent out emails to stakeholders on the meeting in Liberia in September 2015 on the establishment of a pilot initiative for a National Advisory Committee on Oil Palm in Liberia.
- v. On 26<sup>th</sup> September 2015, the Impacts Team presented the decision of the Complaints Panel to the stakeholders in Monrovia, Liberia.
- vi. On 26 October 2015, GVL sent their response to the decision of the CP dated 19 September 2015.
- vii. On 16 November, the Complaints Panel decided that the 'stop work order' may be lifted after GVL renegotiate the FPIC from the communities in Butaw.
- viii. 8 December 2015, GVL asked for a lifting of the Stop Work Order, as they claimed it was at the request of the community. The RSPO Secretariat to draft the letter and circulate it to the Complaints Panel members for review.
- ix. The letter was sent to GVL on 21 Dec 2015 and conditions for the lifting of the "stop work order" were specified in it.
- x. We are waiting for the response from the complainants.
- xi. The Meeting took place on 11 April 2016 but information still pending from GVL and the NGO. Next meeting scheduled for 19 May 2016.
- xii. On 6 June, Secretariat received unofficial information from GVL that the people who were arrested following the May riot in Butaw have been released. Secretariat to wait for formal confirmation.
- xiii. On 5 August, the Secretariat received information that the stakeholders meeting was not successful due to communication problems. A set of questions has been sent to all the complainant NGOs for their views and opinions on the development in the case.

## COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

*For Website*

7 November 2016 | 2.30pm – 7.30pm | Meeting No. 11/2016

Meeting location: *Singapore Room, Shangri La Hotel, Bangkok - Thailand*

- xiv. The next meeting for GVL between Secretariat and Complaints Panel members will be during RT14 in Bangkok.
- xv. It is important for the Secretariat to identify if there is HCV in the area. Another meeting between Secretariat and Complaints Panel scheduled on 6 December 2016 5:00 pm KL time.

### 8. Sale of Concessions/subsidiaries with complaints by members

*We have had the following members selling their subsidiaries instead of resolving the complaints:*

- i. **PT Asiatic Inti Persada/Wilmar**  
Sold to the Ganda Group (non- RSPO members); we lost control over the complaint.
- ii. **PT Sawit Sumber Sarana/Sawit Mandiri Lestari**  
The company is sold with the reason that there is a delay to fulfill the legal/permit requirement so that the company cannot achieve the targets.
- iii. **PT Mitra Austral Sejahtera/Sime Darby**  
They are considering selling based on the fact that it is not profitable.
- iv. **Plantaciones de Pucallpa**  
They are planning to sell as advertisements have appeared in Malaysia and Indonesia. The complaint is pending for resolution.

The RSPO Code of Conduct for members :

*“5. Breaches of this Code*

**5.1** *Members will seek to resolve grievances directly with other member organizations in a timely fashion, and will not make unsubstantiated allegations of breaches against other members.*

**5.2** *Breaches of this Code, or the by-laws and statutes of the RSPO may lead to exclusion from the organization.*

**5.3** *Prior to taking public action in cases of unresolved allegations of breaches of this Code, members will report breaches to the Executive Board, which will deal with the alleged breaches in accordance with the RSPO Grievance Procedure.*

**5.4** *Executive Board Members who are found, after due inquiry, to have breached the Code, will be replaced.*

*What RSPO can do to prevent non-compliant members from selling to non-RSPO members certifiable units where there are severe RSPO Compliance problems?*

#### **20 October 2016**

Secretariat to discuss internally with the Technical Team and inform the updates at the next meeting.

#### **7 November 2016**

The draft of Note of Censure has been circulated to the Complaints Panel. Secretariat to incorporate feedbacks from the members and finalize before publish it to on the website.

## COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

*For Website*

7 November 2016 | 2.30pm – 7.30pm | Meeting No. 11/2016

Meeting location: *Singapore Room, Shangri La Hotel, Bangkok - Thailand*

### DELIBERATION OF COMPLAINTS

Complaint 1	
Member Organization	Agropalma SA
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Brazil
Complainant	José Maria Tabaranã da Costa and Aida Raimunda Maia da Costa
Date filed	13 August 2015
Nature of complaint	That Agropalma has acquired land and planted oil palm in violation of the RSPO Principles and Criteria
Status	Box G- Closed for Monitoring
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to make inquiry on the decision from the Brazilian Courts and authorities

Complaint 2	
Member Organization	PT Limpah Sejahtera (a subsidiary of First Resources Ltd (FRI))
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Yayasan International Animal Rescue Indonesia (YIARI)
Date filed	1 May 2010
Nature of complaint	Violation of RSPO P&C 5.2 and P&C 7.3. The company is alleged to have breached: Principle 5: Environmental responsibility and conservation of natural resources and biodiversity Principle 7: Responsible development of new plantings. The company is alleged to have destroyed Orangutan habitats and not to have carried out an HCV assessment before the development of the plantation.
Status	Box F – Action Plan
Decision /Justification	The company to hire the HCV reviewer.

Complaint 3	
Member Organization	FELDA (Federal Land development Authority) FELDA Ventures Bhd.
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Malaysia
Complainant	Orang Dusun Lahad Datu (Desa Begahak)
Date filed	16 February 2015



## COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

7 November 2016 | 2.30pm – 7.30pm | Meeting No. 11/2016

Meeting location: *Singapore Room, Shangri La Hotel, Bangkok - Thailand*

Nature of complaint	<p>According to the Enquiry National Hak Tanah document by SUHAKAM, the state government had given 1260 acres of land to the Dusun Begahak community in 1981. At the same time, the same land was alienated to FELDA for development. The complainant raised the issue that FELDA has no right to develop their land and should return it to the community because the land originally belonged to the community. The complainant also stated that the cemetery area is being developed by FELDA.</p> <p>Felda enclaved 916 acres of the said land and gave it back to the community. The community planted fruits and other crops on the land.</p> <p>A police report has been made by the community and that is the source of the complaint.</p>
Status	Box F – Action Plan
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to approach the Land and Survey Department of Sabah.

Complaint 4	
Member Organization	PT Sisirau/Ibris Palm Group
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Sumatran Orangutan Society (SOS)
Date filed	29 October 2012
Nature of complaint	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Clearing of HCV land containing Orangutan habitats</li> <li>2. Failing to stop work after the discovery of Orangutans</li> <li>3. Breach of New Planting Procedures</li> </ol>
Status	Box L – Terminated
Decision /Justification	Secretariat has sent the formal letter of termination to the company. The case is fully closed.

Complaint 5	
Member Organization	PT Permata Hijau Pasaman (PHP) 1 –Wilmar International
Membership category	Palm Oil Processors and/or Traders
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	<p>S.H Gampo Alam, <i>Pucuk Adat Nagari Kapa</i> (indigenous leader of Nagari Kapa) as well as Head of <i>Kerapatan Adat Nagari Kapa</i> (KAN – a village/Nagari-level customary institution in Minangkabau which maintains and preserves the Minangkabau customs and culture).</p> <p>Supported by Forest People Programme (FPP) and HuMa (Association for Community and Ecology-Based Law Reform)</p>
Date filed	30 October 2014



## COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

7 November 2016 | 2.30pm – 7.30pm | Meeting No. 11/2016

Meeting location: Singapore Room, Shangri La Hotel, Bangkok - Thailand

Nature of complaint	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Complainant seeks clarity of the extent of PT. PHP 1's nucleus estate in Nagari Kapa.</li> <li>2. Complainant rejects PT. PHP 1's application to the National Land Agency for a Hak Guna Usaha (HGU) certificate over the customary (<i>ulayat</i>) land of Nagari Kapa.</li> <li>3. Violation of RSPO Principles &amp; Criteria 6.2 – community did not participate in decision making on the areas to set aside as HCV areas.</li> <li>4. Complainant seeks clarification to whom will the land be reverted at the end of the HGU period</li> </ol>
Status	Box F – Action Plan
Decision /Justification	The stakeholders meeting with the independent consultant will be conducted in Pasaman Barat on 8-9 December 2016. Secretariat to wait for the result of the meeting.

Complaint 6	
Member Organization	Equatorial Palm Oil PLC
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Liberia
Complainant	Sustainable Development Institute
Date filed	25 September 2013
Nature of complaint	<p>It is alleged that the company has cleared and planted on land that is the customary land of the community in New Cess, Grand Bassa County, Liberia; and is seeking to expand the plantation without the free, prior and informed consent of the communities.</p> <p>The community is also objecting to the company carrying out a re-survey of the existing concession area.</p> <p>The company is alleged to have breached Principle 2.2 &amp; 2.3 of FPIC and Principle 7: Responsible development of new plantings.</p> <p>No NPP notification posted to RSPO.</p>
Status	Box G – Case Closed for monitoring
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to reconfirm the formal response from SDI before making any decision.

Complaint 7	
Member Organization	Plantaciones de Pucallpa SAC
Membership category	Grower
Country	Peru
Complainant	Forest People Program (FPP)

## COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

7 November 2016 | 2.30pm – 7.30pm | Meeting No. 11/2016

Meeting location: Singapore Room, Shangri La Hotel, Bangkok - Thailand

Date filed	5 December 2015
Nature of complaint	Plantaciones de Pucallpa SAC has been accused of human rights violation by the Shipibo community of Santa Clara de Uchunya. In so doing, Plantaciones de Pucallpa has been alleged to have breached the Principles and Criteria of the RSPO on land acquisition and the conservation of forest. These allegations were made in a forum in London; please see link below. <a href="http://www.globalresearch.ca/illegal-deforestation-of-5000-hectares-of-peru-amazon-for-palm-oil-peruvian-indigenous-leader/5486126">http://www.globalresearch.ca/illegal-deforestation-of-5000-hectares-of-peru-amazon-for-palm-oil-peruvian-indigenous-leader/5486126</a>
Status	Box E. Reviewing Response
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to send a strong and clear message to the company through Note of Censure

Complaint 8	
Member Organization	FELDA
Membership category	Grower
Country	Malaysia
Complainant	Article by The Wall Street Journal
Date filed	26 July 2015
Nature of complaint	<b><i>“Palm-Oil Migrant Workers Tell of Abuses on Malaysian Plantations Global palm-oil industry contributes to human trafficking, rights advocates say”.</i></b> <i>The palm-oil plantations of Malaysia have become magnets for refugees from Bangladesh and Myanmar. Many have complained of onerous working conditions and few legal protections. (Syed Zain Al-Mahmood/The Wall Street Journal.)</i> The issues including human trafficking, general poor labour conditions, Use of labour contractors, to exploit illegal immigrants from Bangladesh and Myanmar; Withholding of passports; Poor health care; Pay below minimum wages; Non-payment of wages; Bonded labourers.
Status	Box F. Action Plan
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to contact Technical team on the revised action plan and draft a warning letter for the company.

Complaint 9	
Member Organization	Extractora La Gloria SAS
Membership category	Grower
Country	Colombia
Complainant	Fredy Antonio Corrales, representative of the Colombian Association for Displaced Peoples' Prospects (ASOCOL), Adelfo Segundo Rodríguez, representative of the

## COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

7 November 2016 | 2.30pm – 7.30pm | Meeting No. 11/2016

Meeting location: *Singapore Room, Shangri La Hotel, Bangkok - Thailand*

	Association of Returning Displaced Farmers (ASOCADAR), Senator Iván Cepeda, Senator Alberto Castilla, and Representative Alirio Uribe
Date filed	19 November 2015
Nature of complaint	Extractora La Gloria SAS, in planting palm oil in the former Hacienda Bellacruz- today Hacienda La Gloria- occupies 9,000 hectares in the municipalities of La Gloria, Pelaya and Tamalameque, in southern Cesar Department without following RSPO rules. It does not comply with the following RSPO principles (1.1, 2.1, 2.2, 2.3, 4.5, 5.2, 6.4, 6.13)
Status	Box E. Reviewing Response
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to explore the possibility to mediate both parties.

Complaint 10	
Member Organization	Bumitama Gunajaya Abadi/Bumitama
Membership category	Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Sawit Watch
Date filed	13 November 2015
Nature of complaint	<p>The allegations are:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) Destroying graves and planting trees surrounding the graves;</li> <li>2) Dispute on plasma scheme mechanism;</li> <li>3) Termination of labourers and the status of labourer i.e. are they casual or permanent?</li> <li>4) Compensation not paid directly to the land owner;</li> <li>5) Loss of land certification and using the land of migrants which is still under control of the owner;</li> <li>6) Criminalisation of Gusti Gelombang, a former Company Public Relation officer and now the Head of Cooperative Body.</li> </ol> <p>This case has been handled bilaterally since 2014. It was escalated to RSPO because police came to Sawit Watch's office to arrest Gusti Gelombang, who was in their office at that time</p>
Status	Box G. Closed for Monitoring
Decision /Justification	A stakeholders meeting is scheduled on 8 November 2016. Secretariat to wait for the result of the meeting.

Complaint 11	
Member Organization	PT London Sumatra (Lonsum)
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia

## COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

*For Website*

7 November 2016 | 2.30pm – 7.30pm | Meeting No. 11/2016

Meeting location: *Singapore Room, Shangri La Hotel, Bangkok - Thailand*

Complainant	Community of Desa Pergulaan via Sawit Watch
Date filed	7 April 2009
Nature of complaint	The following points were raised by the community of Desa Pergulaan: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Legality of the extension of the concession and demands for the return of land totalling 165.6 ha.</li> <li>2. The status of the law suit filed by 5 of the residents which is 'out-of-time' (compensation paid in 1971).</li> <li>3. The legality of the security drains to prevent access.</li> <li>4. Prohibiting cattle herding in the plantation.</li> <li>5. The non-employment of residents of Desa Pergulaan in the plantation.</li> <li>6. Failure by Lonsum to carry out Corporate Social Responsibility programs as promised.</li> <li>7. No complaint letters have been addressed to Lonsum directly.</li> <li>8. Status of residents on the Police 'Wanted List'.</li> </ol>
Status	Box E – Reviewing Response
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to approach with Sawit Watch and Bitra on the progress of the case.

Complaint 12	
Member Organization	Golden Veroleum Liberia (GVL)
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Liberia, Africa
Complainant	Green Advocates
Date filed	3 October 2012
Nature of complaint	Violation of the RSPO Principles and Criteria and New Plantings Procedure by: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) Not providing public notification for a 30 day period consistent with the New Planting Procedures,</li> <li>2) By commencing land preparation for new planting and infrastructure development prior to the expiry of the minimum 30-days consultation period.</li> <li>3) By not conducting a comprehensive and participatory independent social and environmental impact assessment(s) of the area concerned and incorporating the results into relevant action plans (see RSPO criteria 5.1, 6.1, 7.1 &amp; 7.4) including the identification of: (a) all primary forest, (b) any area required to maintain or enhance one or more High Conservation Values (HCVs), and (d) local peoples' land.</li> <li>4) Grabbing lands without respecting local customary rights and without the free, prior and informed consent (FPIC) of the customary landowners as represented through representative organizations of their choice (RSPO C2.2, C2.3, C7.5, and C7.6).</li> </ol>

## COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

7 November 2016 | 2.30pm – 7.30pm | Meeting No. 11/2016

Meeting location: Singapore Room, Shangri La Hotel, Bangkok - Thailand

	5) Forcibly evicting the people from their lands (RSPO C7.5 and C7.6).
Status	Box G (Monitoring progress of action plan for Complaint 1 by Green Advocates) Box D – Panel has made a preliminary decision for Complaints 2 to 9.
Decision /Justification	To continue to monitor the developments and engagement with stakeholders towards resolution

Complaint 13	
Member Organization	PT Kartika Prima Cipta/ Golden Agri Resource (GAR)
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Forest People Programme (FPP) and Transformasi untuk Keadilan (TUK) Indonesia
Date filed	14 October 2014
Nature of complaint	Points raised : 1. PT. KPC is in persistent violation of the RSPO P&C pertaining to HCV assessment, the recognition of customary land rights and free, prior, and informed consent (FPIC). Lack of FPIC of the local Dayak and Malay people during the acquisition of the land. 2. The land was acquired without a land tenure study and participatory mapping. 3. Late HCV assessment which was done by Institute Pertanian Bogor, final consultation was in May 2014. 4. Dissatisfaction among smallholders and resentment because of reduced land set aside for plasma compared to HCV areas. 5. The land has been set aside as HCS area that made no provision for customary land uses and tenure and local peoples' livelihood. 6. GAR as the parent company of all 18 subsidiaries listed is acting in violation of the New Planting Procedures (NPP) by submitting information which it knows is false. No HGU exists in 16 of the 18 concessions where NPP was submitted.
Status	Box E. Reviewing Response
Decision /Justification	A meeting between Secretariat and the company scheduled on 8 November 2016. Secretariat to wait for the result of the meeting.

Complaint 14	
Member Organization	PT Sawit Nabati Agro/ PT Sukses Karya Sawit/ PT Berkat Nabati Sawit/ PT Bumi Sawit Sejahtera (IOI Group) –Ketapang
Membership category	Oil Palm Growers
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	AidEnvironment
Date filed	3 April 2015
Nature of complaint	Issues raised by AidEnvironment: a. 10,000 ha of planting without permit (IUP)

## COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

7 November 2016 | 2.30pm – 7.30pm | Meeting No. 11/2016

Meeting location: *Singapore Room, Shangri La Hotel, Bangkok - Thailand*

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>b. Encroachment into the forest sanctuary</li> <li>c. IOI has cleared the land without submitting NPP.</li> </ul>
Status	Box F – Action Plan.
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to wait until the field verification finished. A team will be appointed to produce a summary report from verification on all 3 sites.

Complaint 15	
Member Organization	Poligrow Colombia
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Colombia
Complainant	Environmental Investigation Agency
Date filed	13 August 2015
Nature of complaint	The Italian-owned Poligrow Ltd has prohibited the Jiw and Sikuani indigenous communities from freedom of movement. The EIA's video alleged abuses by RSPO's Italian member in Colombia
Status	Box D – Complaints Legitimate
Decision /Justification	The verification exercise has been completed and the result has been received by the Secretariat based in Latin America. To wait until the report is fully translated before making any decision.

Complaint 16	
Member Organization	Palma Tica SA
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Costa Rica
Complainant	Paulo Hernan Picado Granados, Asociacion de Palmicultores del Sur (ASOPASUR)
Date filed	9 May 2016
Nature of complaint	<p>A group of smallholders Asociación e Palmicultores del Sur (ASOPASUR) in Punta arena are complaining against Palma Tica, saying that they are not being paid fair prices by the company for their FFB. The farmers claim that there is no transparency or clarity in the way the prices are arrived at.</p> <p>Alleged breach of Criterion 1.1: Commitment to Transparency and Criterion 6.10: Growers and mills deal fairly and transparently with smallholder and other local businesses.</p>
Status	Box B – Complaint categorized
Decision /Justification	Secretariat sees the possibility to dismiss the case if it is proven that there is no substance to the claim.

## COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

7 November 2016 | 2.30pm – 7.30pm | Meeting No. 11/2016

Meeting location: Singapore Room, Shangri La Hotel, Bangkok - Thailand

Complaint 17	
Member Organization	Hap Seng Plantations Holdings Bhd.
Membership category	Palm Oil Company
Country	Malaysia
Complainant	Sia Yi Chin of Lahad Datu Sabah
Date filed	11 November 2015
Nature of complaint	The complainant is claiming that Hap Seng Plantations Bhd is illegally occupying his property (River Estates) of 6,454 acres in Lahad Datu, Sabah. He says that he is the beneficial owner of the said land and the land office in Kota Kinabalu has confirmed that the said land is still in his name as beneficial owner. He has filed a civil suit against Hap Seng; originating summons: BKI-24-127/5 of 2012 filed on 30.07.2015
Status	Box D – Complaint Legitimate
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to wait for the progress through the court system.

Complaint 18	
Member Organization	PT PP London Sumatra
Membership category	Growers
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Rainforest Action Network (RAN), Indonesia
Date filed	9 June 2016 (reported case) to be formal on 11 October 2016
Nature of complaint	A report published by RAN, OPPUK, and ILRF titled, " <u><i>The Human Cost of Conflict Palm Oil: Indofood, PepsiCo's Hidden Link to Worker Exploitation in Indonesia.</i></u> " The report reveals the findings of field investigations and worker interviews completed on two palm oil plantations owned and operated RSPO member and Indofood subsidiary PT London Sumatra. The full report available at <a href="http://ran.org/indofood">ran.org/indofood</a> .
Status	Box C – Panel Convened
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to check with SAI Global on the verification result before making any decision. Secretariat to draft a warning letter for the company and send it to the CP members for review.