

Minutes of Meeting

RSPO Communications & Claims Standing Committee (C&C SC)

Date: September 15, 2016

Venue: Schiphol Airport, NL

Time: CET 10:30 am – 4:00 pm

ATTENDANCE LIST

Stakeholder Group	Members	Organization
Consumer Goods Manufacturer	Jan Kees Vis (JKV)	Unilever
Association member	Eddy Esselink (EE)	MVO
Environmental NGO	Emma Keller (EK)	WWF UK
Trader	Judith Murdoch (JM)	AAK
Refiner/Trader	Marie Lavialle- Piot (MLP)	Cargill
Bank	Jose den Toom (JDT)	Rabobank
Service provider	Paula Den Hartog, UTZ	UTZ
RSPO Secretariat	Stefano Savi (SS)	RSPO Secretariat
RSPO Secretariat	Danielle Morley (DM)	RSPO Secretariat
RSPO Secretariat	Gayathri Velayutham (GV)	RSPO Secretariat
RSPO Secretariat	Ashwin Selvaraj (AS)	RSPO Secretariat
Consultant	Giovanni Colombo (GC)	H+K Strategies

Excused

- Marinella Giacobbe, Ferrero
- Leela Barrock, Simedarby
- Laura Jungmann, Ahold
- Carrie Svingen, WWF
- Andy Green, BMTrada
- Bob Norman, Greenpalm

Minutes

PART I

April minutes approved w/o any comments.

JKV asked if Secretariat has contacted Unilever US team.

AP: Dan Strachey to follow-up

Global Updates: SS

Recruitment Progress

Three new members of staff in the outreach department:

1. Recruited Imam EL Marzuq as Community Outreach & Engagement Manager in Indonesia. Imam worked for RSPO already and is based in Jakarta. RSPO Secretariat will also hire a Global Manager to be based in KL.
2. US Outreach and Engagement Manager, Daniel Strachey, based in New York.
3. Gayathri Velayutham: ASEAN Outreach & Engagement Manager (responsible for SEA excl Indonesia). Based in the KL office.

Indonesia

- RSPO and WWF undertook Indonesian media visit in Riau and Medan to the Musim Mas estates as part of WWF campaign “buy the right one”
- Continuous media outreach in Indonesia - two press circles. One in March with local and global outlets: Bloomberg, Reuters and Forbes.
- RSPO started to organise NGO forums to improve cooperation. RSPO has opened a WhatsApp group with NGOs in Indonesia, managed by RSPO Indonesia; exchanging on complaints and updates on RSPO systems.

ASEAN

In Singapore RSPO has been working with WWF and others to launch a [local commitment](#) on sustainable palm oil, launched on 27 June. Five founding members: Unilever, Danone, Ayam Brand, IKEA, Wildlife Reserves Singapore. Not yet agreed to a target, for now the priority is to have sustainability reporting by the members.

Japan

On 27 September there was the first event in Japan with support of CGF, Green Purchasing Network, and Japan Business Initiative for Biodiversity. RSPO has also been working in Japan with banks and recently there was a report by RAN on Japanese Banks, which have been contacted by the RSPO financial institutions task force.

India

RSPO is working with a solvent extractors association. A workshop was organised in May and RSPO is improving ties with growers and smallholders in India. Smallholders are ready for certification, which was unexpected. RSPO is moving in this direction by working on a national interpretation in India, so it will be an Indian-owned initiative. Godrej Industries is also pushing for smallholder certification.

Additional stakeholder activity:

- A study to map the supply chain in India. Looking for a consultant to deliver it
- Working with the Centre for Responsible Business and Solidaridad. In SE Asia they are led by the Indian representative and have a policy of being standard-neutral. There has been some difficulty in landing messaging
- An Indian Forum for Sustainable Palm Oil will be launched in November. RSPO is finalising stakeholder mapping and is looking at an outreach campaign through the sponsorship of Globoil India 2016.

China

- Media engagement has generated good coverage.
- First China Forum held in July.
- Collaboration with CAEC – promoting environmental cooperation between China and ASEAN member states, acting as a forum for joint dialogue. Planning to have an MoU with them. RSPO is working with CCAI, ready to sign an MoU with them. CCAI is under the direct responsibility of CNCA, the government agency which can legalise the RSPO and the RSPO Trademark.
- RSPO held an event in Beijing and Shanghai in August to launch a campaign “say yes to sustainable palm oil”. Using Wechat as a new aggregator of platforms to raise RSPO’s visibility
- RSPO had first meeting with the Chinese steering committee. Need to do more work to make Chinese stakeholders work as a group, rather than single entities. Among them is Mars, which is all MB and moving to SG.
- Chinese membership:
 - 51 members, including all the big importers in China
 - 50 certified facilities
 - COFCO now the second importer, shared an ACOP saying that by 2018 they aim to certify all their facilities. This shows that physical supply is possible and is changing the market fundamentals.

USA

- Working with Context Group on a stakeholder mapping and strategy
- Good ties with US brands and an important US retailer has promised to put TM on private label products
- Working on new messaging framework and strategy for the US. This will be reviewed with Context Group.

JKV: this is good progress, but India is still a slow market.

RT14 Update: GV

- Sponsorship: P&G and IFC (Silver) have come on board to support smallholders. Musim Mas and Sime Darby have taken Gold. Most exhibition booths are booked except for two. All together selling 15 booths.
- Smallholders will attend and play an interactive game. RSPO will display TM bearing products.
- More speakers TBC

JM: there was a series of bombings. Last year we decided to change the venue. What are the risks?

SS: Recent bombings were not in Bangkok. Last year we changed plans in August. We really need to hope that changing a venue will not be necessary. Another risk is the Zika virus in SE Asia which so far seems to be under control. Hopefully we will not need to change the venue.

GV: RSPO is organising a media visit to Krabi, joint efforts by Europe and Asia. We anticipate no more than 10 or 15 reporters attending the visit. The idea is to expose them to challenges, best practices and the smallholder situation.

DM: We have been in touch regarding the plenary session on regional updates, where you asked us to identify a suitable speaker.

GV: this is a crucial contribution. We have identified a speaker from Singapore Alliance, and potentially from Indonesia and India. In China we have identified a representative from CFNA to speak. We are also exploring speakers from Latin America and Africa, but they are not confirmed yet. The objective is to look at challenges and best practices of local initiatives on sustainable palm oil.

SS: We need feedback from SC C&C on who could be a good speaker and what issues you would like to raise in this session.

JKV: Where do the smallholders at RT14 come from?

GV: from Indonesia and Thailand mostly. We are exploring also Africa and LatAm.

Communications & Claims Rules

RSPO are reviewing the Rules to incorporate the new RSPO Credit (Book & Claim) and RSPO NEXT. SS presented a redraft and invited SC C&C to review the proposed changes. SS asked for consensus decision by C&C before the 30 day public consultation. RSPO NEXT claims rules are based on the RSPO NEXT Eligibility Document, previously discussed by the RSPO Board.

SS: At this point there is no physical supply of RSPO NEXT material. A grower which is RSPO NEXT certified can start selling NEXT credits to a SC member which also complies

with eligibility criteria. The draft presented that on-product NEXT claims are possible if you buy 20% through SG or IP (coming from NEXT) from a mill and on top you buy RSPO NEXT credits. Otherwise, if you buy only the credits you can only communicate in corporate communications.

JM: this is too burdensome and I do not think anyone will take this up.

JKV: the SC C&C agrees that RSPO cannot say that there is no physical supply for NEXT and then allow B2C claims that imply the physical presence of RSPO NEXT in a specific product. This would be possible only through IP. Hence, the text relating to RSPO NEXT Business to Consumer claims should be removed from the draft.

SS: this is a missed opportunity. We will send this decision to the Board to review the eligibility criteria to enable physical claims.

DM: The SC C&C feels that the draft revisions to the Rules on Claims & Communications should follow the existing RSPO NEXT eligibility criteria.

JKV: Yes the section on Business to Consumer claims shall be deleted because physical supply is not possible.

SS: Shall we also delete the section on logo?

JKV: can I assume logo can be used in corporate communications?

SS: no it is not possible. We need to put "NEXT Credit" on the logo.

AS: do we need a logo for corporate communications?

JKV: we should have a logo saying only NEXT.

SS: I do not understand why we shall have logo for corporate communications. It was conceived for B2C communications

JKV: We shall get rid of the logo then.

(Lunch break)

PART II

Update from WWF - EK

On 21 September WWF will release palm oil scorecard, covering 120 companies across the world. Welcome RSPO and its members to share and retweet the scorecard. Q&A to distribute to communication teams.

AP: EK to share

The outlook is good, many companies are leading the way. Focus on which sectors are not moving, such as the food service sector. Europe and Asia have different volumes, many more companies are covered in Europe. In the dairy sector only a couple of companies covered, as there is no much volume in this sector.

Crisis communications

- GC informed the SC C&C that H+K will hold a crisis communications workshop in KL on 3-4 October, with the RSPO Secretariat, to discuss best strategy to deal with crisis and issue management at the global level and explore opportunities and tools to train the RSPO staff on crisis and issue management.
- The workshop will include representatives of all the relevant departments in the Secretariat and will also look at how RSPO can improve its internal procedures and protocols to deal with crisis and issues which put the organisation under pressure and require an efficient system to share information internally and externally.

DM: we have a new Head of Impact, who is going to build a stronger impact team, in light of fire issues, and other similar issues. Global Forest Watch is improving, but the key constraint remains access to concession maps.

T&T Updates - AS

LMC market study has been completed. Some outcomes have been presented at EURT in Milan. We will publish a report with EPOA on the occasion of EPOC together with some data on CSPO volumes in Europe

EE: at EPOC we want to show full picture on the product categories where palm oil is used, sustainable and unsustainable, including also biofuels. Let's combine forces to gather data.

JKV: will the chart be circulated within this group?

DM: this is not on the radar of the communications team yet, but we should be involved

EE: yes can share it. But I would like to avoid too many additional comments.

DM: I would like to have Fay in touch with T&T to work on this.

EE: ESPO wants to use data with governments. EPOA will use it at the event.

AS: On 3 October there will be a smallholder strategy workshop, based on a resolution adopted at the 2015 RT, where there was a call to develop a Smallholder strategy.

JKV: Did you invite Aidenvironment and IDH (landscape programmes, in Liberia and Kalimantan)?

AS: we don't have them.

EE: Please reach out to Dan Vencin, IDH, who runs the Landscape Programme.

From GP to eTrace - Paula Hartog, UTZ

[eTrace video](#)

eTrace upgrade means that in future the (potential) mill of origin will be known also for SG and MB, not just IP. As of Jan 2017, also the credits will have traceability to the mill level.

Declaration of conventional sources

- Global list of mill is being completed
- Industries can check every six months where they source from
- Declaration of conventional sources is voluntary
- Helps companies to have more traceability data

Credit trade will be called "PalmTrace" as of 1st Jan 2017. GP members have to become RSPO members but it is not automatic. GP certificates become RSPO Credits

Certified mills, crushers and smallholders can trade Credits. Mills will be able to trade Credits only for CSPO, not CSPKO and CSPKE.

AS: RSPO has started to communicate about this change two months ago through the website and the eGazette, we'll continue to update people. We are also planning to offer training at the RT in Bangkok, and also in other contexts. We're also thinking to do a webinar in October specifically on the Book & Claim model, to inform GP users that they need to change to RSPO Credits and explain them the new rules. This would be very useful for the US markets where the purchase of credits is very high.

European communications and stakeholder engagement - DM

DM presented an overview of the media coverage achieved at the EURT in Milan. The main challenge in the media outreach was the negative context created by the EFSA reports on MCPD esters in palm oil and other vegetable oils, which generated many concerns in Italy and has fuelled a trend towards the substitutions of palm oil and the use of no-palm oil labels (e.g. by the Barilla brand "Mulino Bianco").

DM: the media partnership with Guardian Sustainable Business (GSB) is doing well, ends Feb 2017. They are working on a new on-the-ground feature in Liberia, which will be multimedia. We will have a seminar at GSB 23 November, which will be a follow-up to the new piece on “Africa: a new palm oil frontier”.

DM asked SC C&C to give suggestions on topics and possible invitees to get on the panel of the GSB Seminar.

JKV: you could invite someone from the Prince of Wales’ Foundation. DM will identify a contact there. JKV also suggested someone from the Commonwealth Office.

DM: We put a call for proposal out on Reputation Monitoring. Two pitches: Reputation Consultancy (15500 £) and Digital Clicks (16200£). SC C&C agreed to go ahead with Reputation Consultancy, as suggested by DM.

AP: DM to reach out to Prince of Wales Foundation and Commonwealth Office

EURT

- DM showed the [video report](#) of the 2016 EURT in Milan.
- DM: I was in Paris last week and met the French Alliance to discuss the possibility of EURT 2017 in Paris event. Last time we wanted to do it in France but we cancelled because of football and terrorist attacks.
- Next year the challenge will be the French elections; Eid and clashes with CGF event. If we want to go to France we have to go during the first week of July. SC C&C agreed first week of July is okay.
- DM informed the SC C&C about the email she has received from the French Alliance, in response to RSPO’s proposal to hold the EURT in Paris and establish closer cooperation with the Alliance to prepare and host the conference. In essence, the email explains that the French Alliance is willing to cooperate and support the EURT only if RSPO embarks on a broader communication campaign and it also is able to announce at the time of the conference significant improvements in its Principles and Criteria (e.g. no peat, zero deforestation) and a stronger position against “no-palm oil” labels.

EE: We should remind the French Alliance last year was part of the commitment to support the Amsterdam declaration.

JKV: you should try to discuss with them but if they insist drop the idea of a conference in Paris.

The SC C&C agreed that RSPO will not hold the EURT in Paris without full collaboration of the French Alliance.

JKV: as alternatives you should consider Spain; Madrid and Bilbao (which is close to refineries if you want them)

EE: this could be an opportunity to set up an initiative in Spain.

JM: you may also want to consider Poland.

Poland

DM: I have been corresponding with UN Global Compact Poland and agreed to have a meeting with their palm oil working group on 4 October in Poland. Plan is to set up a national alliance in Poland. They were already engaging at the national level and have good links with the government. It will not be a consumer push, but very much B2B. Because of COP21 and UNFCCC, there is will to pursue CSPO locally.

EE: is the Polish food and drink federation involved? PFPZ

DM: Let's discuss about this. It would be good to have the experience of other alliances which can share their best practices with the Polish industry, e.g. someone from the NL and UK.

France

- DM met with the advisor of State Secretary Pompili, who is responsible for the Biodiversity Bill in which a palm oil tax was discussed, but eventually not adopted. DM will met the task force appointed by the President to review sustainable vegetable oils next week.
- DM met also retailer Casino, where she had a good introductory meeting and discussion on 'No Palm Oil' labels
- GCI explained that Biodiversity Bill has been adopted in August, but it does not introduce any new additional taxation on palm oil. However, at the moment both the State Secretary and the Senate are preparing two reports, in parallel, on the taxation of vegetable oils in France which will probably be completed in October and November. There is a risk therefore that the palm oil taxation proposal is considered again in the context of the approval of the 2017 budget law, which will happen in November/December this year.

Italy

DM explained that there is a very negative trend going on in the country. But RSPO shall stick to its position, as it is not its role to convince people to eat palm oil.

Everyone agrees

Biofuels

DM: There is a key question on what we shall do about RSPO RED, given that almost no one uses the RSPO certification in the biofuel sector.

EE: This issue has not decided yet by T&T. It will be decided by the Board.

Nordics

DM: in Norway the palm oil debate is not critical any longer.

Denmark: consumers seem not interested. Danish industry not very active.

Sweden: the debate more active and we see more media coverage.

EE: In Sweden we have commitment from food, but two weeks ago also the cosmetic and detergent sector decided to team up, which is a very good step.

EK: Swedish Soy dialogue is miles ahead of any other commitment.

Review of narrative for Europe

DM explained the importance of updating the RSPO narrative for Europe, in light of all the recent developments. This means answering to a number of strategic questions, such as: What is our 100% target? Do we to include biofuel or not? Are social and labour issues becoming more important?

She proposed to hold a strategy workshop.

EE: the biofuel question is how much energy is worth putting into the battle with the other schemes?

JKV: is there a battle to be fought? There is no demand in the market for RSPO-RED. You just need to look at the market.

Amsterdam Declaration

EE: At the moment Governments of Italy, Belgium, Sweden and Switzerland are looking into signing Amsterdam Declaration. Netherlands is promoting.

DM: agreed to discuss with Eddy and share next steps.

AOB

- Date for next meeting TBC - suggested diary poll.

Action Points

1. DS to follow up with US Unilever team
2. EK to share WWF Scorecard
3. EE & DM to discuss next steps for Amsterdam Declaration