

COMPLAINTS PANEL MINUTES OF MEETING

for Website

Date: 25 September 2024 @ 5.00pm - 6.35pm

Meeting : via Zoom

MEMBERS OF THE COMPLAINTS PANEL
WEIGHDERS OF THE COURTEMINTS PANCE
 Henry Barlow (Chair - CCP) Lim Sian Choo (Co Chair) Michelle Desilets Marieke Leegwater Lanash Thanda Robert Kruger Florentine van den Eerenbeemt Priya Gopalan Carl Dagenhart Kartika Dewi Irene Aycinena Abascal Miguel Tejada Iraizoz Henky Satrio Wibowo Juliarta Bramansa Ottay
GENERAL AGENDA
 Opening Remarks by Chairperson RSPO Antitrust Guidelines Declaration of Conflict of Interest To confirm and adopt the minutes of 28 August 2024 CP Meeting New Allegations Complaints Case Statistics Complaints Panel Meeting Dates 7.1 Dates for CP Monthly Meetings 7.2 Dates for CP Physical Meetings 7.3 Expansion of the Complaints Panel Post Complaints Monitoring



9. Dispute Settlement Facility (DSF)
10. Commitment of Financial Institutions.
11. 1st Internal Voluntary Review of the Complaints and Appeals Procedures
12. ASC-CP Joint Meeting
13. Complaints for deliberation
Group 1 - COMPLAINTS FOR DELIBERATION
 PT. Sari Dumai Sejati (a subsidiary of AAA Oils and Fats Pte Ltd (APICAL Group) vs Mr. Hidayat Rasyid Poligrow Colombia S.A.S. vs Inversiones Chirajara S.A.S. NATURACEITES S. A. vs Requested for Confidentiality Palmas del Espino S.A. vs Requested for Confidentiality
Group 2 - COMPLAINTS FOR DELIBERATION
 PT Perkebunan Nusantara V (PERSERO) vs Requested for Confidentiality PT. Tunggal Mitra Plantation (a subsidiary of Sime Darby Plantation Berhad) vs Requested for Confidentiality PT Citra Sawit Cemerlang (a subsidiary of Genting Plantations Berhad) vs Requested for Confidentiality PT Swadaya Mukti Prakarsa (a subsidiary of First Resources Limited) vs Requested for Confidentiality PT Mitra Karya Sentosa (a subsidiary of First Resources Limited) vs Requested for Confidentiality
Group 3 - COMPLAINTS FOR DELIBERATION
 PT. Kartika Prima Cipta (PT. KPC) - subsidiary of Golden Agri Resources (GAR) vs Forest Peoples Programme & TuK Indonesia Golden Agri Resources (GAR) vs Forest Peoples Programme & Elk Hills Foundation First Resources Limited vs Requested for Confidentiality PT Inecda (a subsidiary of S&G Biofuel Pte. Ltd) vs Requested for Confidentiality Energy & Palma S.A. (a subsidiary of HOLDING LA FABRIL S.A) vs Requested for Confidentiality PT. Bumi Pratama Khatulistiwa (subsidiary of Wilmar International Limited) vs Requested for Confidentiality Energy & Palma S.A. (subsidiary of La Fabril Group) vs Requested for Confidentiality



DETAILS OF THE AGENDA:

No.		Agenda Agenda		
1.	Opening Remarks from Chairperson			
	Opening speech by CCI	Opening speech by CCP.		
2.	RSPO Antitrust Guideli	ines		
	RSPO Antitrust Guideli	ines were read to the CP.		
3.	Declaration of "No Cor	nflict of Interest"		
	No further Conflict of Interest declared by other CP members.			
4.	To confirm and adopt t	the minutes of 28 August 2024 during the Complaints Panel Meeting		
	Minutes of 28 August	2024 adopted unanimously.		
5.	New allegation subm	itted		
5.1				
	RSPO/2024/12/HN	PT Harapan Sawit Lestari (a subsidiary of Cargill Incorporated)		
	Complainant	Mr Martarinus		
	Complaint received	04 September 2024		
	Location	Kalimantan Barat, Indonesia		
	Allegations • The Complainant alleges that the final entitlement payment he received from the Respondent was not in accordance with the wages he received during his employment.			
		•		
	Discussion on 25 Septe	ember 2024:-		
	1. Initial Diagnosis is in progress.			



5.2

RSPO/2024/13/MAM	Compañía Industrial Aceitera Coto Cincuenta y Cuatro S.A			
Complainant	Requested for confidentiality			
Complaint received	11 September 2024			
Location	Costa Rica			
Allegations	 The Complainant alleges that the Respondent is breaching the NPP, since they proceeded to deforest the areas of protected forest and secondary forest to plant palm oil at el Bambu Farm. Environmental damage is denoted by the presence of palm oil and canals drainage. 			

Discussion on 25 September 2024:-

1. Initial Diagnosis is in progress.

6. Complaints Cases Statistics

Total cases in 2024

Month	Complaints received	Country	Open	Closed	Rejected	Withdrawn
January	1	Indonesia	0	0	1	0
February	1	Indonesia	1	0	0	0
March	3	Indonesia (2) Colombia	3	0	0	0
April	3	Guatemala	1	0	2	0
May	1	Peru	1	0	0	0
June	0	0	0	0	0	0
July	2	Indonesia	2	0	1	0
August	0	0	0	0	0	0
September	2	Indonesia Costa Rica	2	0	0	0



Total Active Cases by Country and Year (as of 20.09.2024)

Country	Active Cases	
Indonesia	12	
Colombia 1		
Ecuador	2	
Guatemala	1	
Peru 1		
Costa Rica	1	
TOTAL	18	

Year	Active Cases	
2014	1	
2020	1	
2021	2	
2022	2	
2023	3	
2024	9	
TOTAL	18	

7. Complaints Panel

7.1 Dates for Complaints Panel monthly meetings

Discussion on 25 September 2024:-

1. CP meeting dates for the first half of 2025 have been scheduled.

7.2 Dates for Complaints Panel Physical Meetings

Discussion on 25 September 2024:-

1. The CP Physical meeting is scheduled on 10.11.2024.

7.3 Expansion of Complaints Panel

Discussion on 25 September 2024:-

1. An individual has applied to be an Affiliate Member to qualify for the Selection Interview of CP members.



8. Post Complaint's Monitoring

8.1 FELDA Global Venture - (Article by The Wall Street Journal)

Discussion on 25 September 2024:-

1. Pending receipt of a further document from the Respondent.

8.2 Extractora de la Gloria SAS

Discussion on 25 September 2024:-

1. Pending further updates from the Respondent about the status of the judicial processes and the action plan presented to the National Government.

8.3 Golden Veroleum Liberia (GVL)

Discussion on 25 September 2024:-

1. Pending submission of Briefing Note to the CP.

8.4 PT. Bumitama Gunajaya Agro (subsidiary of Bumitama Agri Ltd)

Discussion on 25 September 2024:-

- 1. The parties met in Pontianak on 30.08.2024 to negotiate their updated settlement proposals.
- 2. The parties agreed upon and finalised their Terms of Reference for negotiations during the said meeting.
- 3. On 20.09.2024, the parties furnished the Secretariat with their PCM progress report for the month of September 2024 which has been uploaded on the case tracker.
- 4. The Respondent furnished their settlement counteroffer to the Complainant on 25.09.2024 which is now pending the Complainant's comments.

8.5 Aceites Y Derivados Sociedad Anonima (ACEYDESA)

Discussion on 25 September 2024:-

1. The Secretariat is in the midst of reviewing the documents furnished by the Respondent related to the progress report on the implementation of the action plan.



9. Dispute Settlement Facility (DSF)

Discussion on 25 September 2024:-

1. Status quo. The next DSF GoA Physical Meeting will proceed as scheduled on 11.11.2024.

10. Commitments of Financial Institution(s)

Discussion on 25 September 2024:-

1. No further updates.

11. 1st Internal Voluntary Review of the Complaints and Appeals Procedures

Discussion on 25 September 2024:-

1. Review of the comments of the Steering Group members on the revised Report on Recommendations ongoing.

12. ASC - CP JOINT MEETING

Discussion on 25 September 2024:-

1. Pending the scheduling of the next ASC-CP joint meeting.

Roundtable on Sustainable Palm Oil | Page 7



COMPLAINTS FOR DELIBERATION:-

GROUP 1

Complaint 1.1 PT. Sari Dumai Sejati (a subsidiary of AAA Oil and Fats Pte Ltd (APICAL Group) vs Mr. Hidayat Rasyid			
Case Reference	RSPO/2023/12/RR		
Date Filed	03 August 2023		
Respondent	PT. Sari Dumai Sejati (a subsidiary of AAA Oils and Fats Pte Ltd (APICAL Group)		
Membership Category	Processors and / or Traders		
Country	Indonesia		
Complainant	Mr. Hidayat Rasyid		
Complaint Description	 The Complainant is a representative of a community, and the Respondent is a Crude Palm Oil producer. Allegations are with regards to unsustainable operations at the Respondent's plant, causing severe air and noise pollution, disrupting and affecting the daily lives of the community. 		
Status	Investigation / Deliberation		
Decision / Justification	 The Secretariat is in the midst of drafting an updated Briefing Note. Pending receipt of further documentation from the Respondent. 		



Complaint 1.2 Poligrow Colombia S.A.S. vs Inversiones Chirajara S.A.S.			
Case Reference	RSPO/2024/04/MAM		
Date Filed	18 March 2024		
Respondent	Poligrow Colombia S.A.S.		
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower		
Country	Colombia		
Complainant	Inversiones Chirajara S.A.S.		
Complaint Description	 The Respondent infringed a private property to do a firebreak. The Respondent destroyed part of the forest of the plot of land and affected the place where the Complainant's cattle were located. The Respondent did not comply with a conciliation agreement signed between the parties. 		
Status	Investigation / Deliberation		
Decision / Justification	 The Secretariat furnished the Complainant's response to the Respondent and requested the Respondent to confirm its position on the request for confidentiality of documents. Pending receipt of a response from the Respondent. 		



Complaint 13 NA	TURACEITES S. A. vs Requested for confidentiality		
Case Reference	RSPO/2024/06/MAM		
Date Filed	24 April 2024		
Respondent	NATURACEITES S. A.		
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower		
Country	Guatemala		
Complainant	Requested for confidentiality		
Complaint Description	 The Complainant alleges that the Respondent is affecting the compliance of the act on corporate due diligence obligations for the prevention of human right violations in the supply chain. The Respondent has abused the human rights of the indigenous population since the Company has carried out an unlawful seizure of land and water. The Respondent has not complied with labour law, because the Company has unjustifiably withheld the appropriate wage. Occupational health and safety regulations are not respected by the Respondent. The Complainant alleges that the improper disposal of waste made by the Respondent is affecting the environment of the area where the community lives. 		
Status	Investigation / Deliberation		
Decision / Justification	 The Respondent furnished a fresh response requesting for confidentiality to be applied to some documents based on legal reasons. The Secretariat is in the midst of reviewing the said response. 		



Complaint 1.4 Pa	almas del Espino S.A. vs Requested for confidentiality	
Case Reference	RSPO/2024/09/MAM	
Date Filed	27 May 2024	
Respondent	Palmas del Espino S.A.	
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower	
Country	Peru	
Complainant	Requested for confidentiality	
Complaint Description	 The Complainant alleges that the Respondent has acquired FFB using restrictive competition practices, which affects smallholders. The Respondent has omitted the RSPO antitrust guidelines. 	
Status	Investigation / Deliberation	
Decision / Justification	 The Complainant responded with new facts and allegations that were not included in the Complaints Form. The Secretariat has requested clarification from the Complainant. Pending receipt of a response from the Complainant. 	



GROUP 2

Complaint 2.1 PT Perkebunan Nusantara V (PERSERO) vs Requested for confidentiality			
Case Reference	RSPO/2022/03/CRP		
Date Filed	04 March 2022		
Respondent	PT. Perkebunan Nusantara V (PERSERO)		
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower		
Country	Indonesia		
Complainant	Requested for confidentiality		
Complaint Description	 The Respondent is alleged of illegally controlling some of the KKPA (Primary Member Cooperative Credit) objects, as well as violating the KKPA agreement. The Respondent is alleged of embezzling funds and fraud in the development of oil palm plantations. The Respondent is alleged of violating the agreement related to the sale of the farmers' fruits which should have been disbursed to the Complainant to be distributed to its members and illegal bailout funds. 		
Status	Appeals Submitted		
Decision / Justification	1. Appeal process ongoing.		



Justification

Complaint 2.2 PT Tunggal Mitra Plantation (a subsidiary of SD Guthrie Berhad) vs **Requested for confidentiality Case Reference** RSPO/2024/02/RR **Date Filed** 23 February 2024 Respondent PT. Tunggal Mitra Plantation (a subsidiary of SD Guthrie Berhad) Membership Oil Palm Grower Category Riau, Indonesia Country Requested for confidentiality Complainant Complaint Alleged failure by the Respondent Company to carry out its corporate social Description responsibility with regard to community empowerment and building a sustainable partnership with the community. **Status** Investigation/Deliberation - (Bilateral Engagement process) Decision / 1. Draft decision letter furnished to CP for endorsement.



Complaint 2.3 PT Citra Sawit Cemerlang (a subsidiary of Genting Plantations Berhad) vs Requested for confidentiality	
Case Reference	RSPO/2024/03/LSL
Date Filed	04 March 2024
Respondent	PT Citra Sawit Cemerlang (a subsidiary of Genting Plantations Berhad)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Kalimantan Barat, Indonesia
Complainant	Requested for confidentiality
Complaint Description	 Allegations revolve around land issues where the Complainant(s) were evicted by the Respondent from their agricultural land. There are elements of intimidation by the Respondent and local authorities in the process of resolving the disagreements on the aforementioned land dispute. The Respondent destroyed the irrigation built by the government.
Status	Investigation/Deliberation - DSF mediation process
Decision / Justification	 Both Parties have confirmed and agreed to the Mediation Process Agreement. The DSF Mediation process will proceed accordingly.



Decision /

Justification

Complaint 2.4 PT Swadaya Mukti Prakarsa (a subsidiary of First Resources Limited) vs Requested for confidentiality RSPO/2024/05/RR **Case Reference Date Filed** 20 March 2024 Respondent PT Swadaya Mukti Prakarsa (a subsidiary of First Resources Limited) Oil Palm Grower Membership Category Country Kalimantan Barat, Indonesia Complainant Requested for confidentiality Complaint Allegations raised against the Respondent are pertaining to a variety of Description workers rights violations, such as poor working conditions, non-provisions of subsidy, non-payment of social security (BPJS), poor safety conditions, workers health, unreasonable working hours, amongst others. The Complainant also alleged that several of its workers had been arrested by the police, for protesting against the Respondent company pertaining to their rights. **Status** Investigation/Deliberation - Bilateral Engagement process

1. Bilateral Engagement process ongoing.



Complaint 2.5 PT Mitra Karya Sentosa (a subsidiary of First Resources Limited) vs Requested for confidentiality

Case Reference	RSPO/2024/10/RH
Date Filed	10 July 2024
Respondent	PT Mitra Karya Sentosa (a subsidiary of First Resources Limited)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Kalimantan Barat, Indonesia
Complainant	Requested for confidentiality
Complaint Description	• The Respondent conducted land clearing, planting, and construction of a concession boundary road beyond the boundaries set out under its plantation business license (IUP) and/or right-to-cultivate land title (HGU).
Status	Investigation/Deliberation
Decision / Justification	 Complaint formally accepted. Pending receipt of a formal response from the Respondent.



GROUP 3

Complaint 3.1 PT. I	Kartika Prima Cipta (GAR) vs Forest Peoples Programme & TuK
Case Reference	PreCAP/2014/03/IR
Date Filed	13 October 2014
Respondent	PT. Kartika Prima Cipta (PT.KPC) - Golden Agri Resources (GAR)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia – Kapuas Hulu, West Kalimantan
Complainant	Forest Peoples Programme (FPP) and (Transformasi untuk Keadilan) TuK Indonesia
Complaint Description	 Points raised:- PT KPC is in persistent violation of the RSPO P&C pertaining HCV assessment, the recognition of customary land rights and free, prior, and informed consent (FPIC). Lack of FPIC of the local Dayak and Malay people in the process of land take over. Land takeover was done without land tenure study and participatory mapping. Late HCV assessment which was done by IPB, final consultation was in May 2014. Dissatisfaction by smallholders and resentment because of reduced post facto set aside for HCV rather than getting plasma scheme (20%). Set aside land as HCS area that made no provision for customary land uses and tenure and local people livelihood. GAR as the parent company of all 18 subsidiaries listed in acting in violation of the New Planting Procedure (NPP) by submitting information which is known as false. No HGU in 16 of 18 NPP. The assessors which have endorsed GAR's HCV assessment, ESIAs and social engagement actions, are in violation of their responsibility to provide impartial assessment of company compliance with RSPO P&C.
Status	Investigation / Deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. The CP is in the midst of reviewing the draft decision letter.



	iolden Agri Resources (GAR) vs Forest Peoples Programme & Elk Hills oundation
Case Reference	RSPO/2020/04/IR
Date Filed	2 March 2020
Respondent	Golden Agri Resource (GAR)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Forest Peoples Programme & Elk Hills Foundation
Complaint Description	 The Respondent, through its subsidiaries located in Central Kalimantan, operate its plantations with permits which never had the force of law; The Respondent, through its employees have been involved in the payment of bribes to provincial officials in Central Kalimantan.
Status	Investigation / Deliberation
Decision / Justification	The Briefing Note has been peer-reviewed and will be circulated to the CP members.



Complaint 3.3 Fi	rst Resources Limited vs Requested for confidentiality
Case Reference	RSPO/2021/04/EN
Date Filed	8 March 2021
Respondent	First Resources Limited
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Requested for confidentiality
Complaint Description	 The Respondent allegedly has ownership, control and influence over a company called Fangiono Agro Plantation (FAP) Agri, a non-RSPO member who was not declared in the Respondent's RSPO Group Membership. The Respondent also allegedly has ownership, control and influence of an Indonesian company, Ciliandry Anky Abadi (CAA) who is a subsidiary of a British Virgin Islands registered company by the name of Sima Capital. This company too was not declared to be a part of the Respondent's RSPO Group Membership. The Respondent, via FAP or by FAP's 11 subsidiaries have violated the RSPO Principles and Criteria by deforestation, peatland degradation, using lands for plantation without FPIC, river pollution, and unilateral layoffs of workers. The Respondent, via CAA, have violated the RSPO Principles and Criteria by deforestation, peatland degradation, using lands for plantation without FPIC, and river pollution. The Respondent is violating its NDPE Commitments, the RSPO Principle and Criteria, the RSPO Code of Conduct, and RSPO membership rules. The Complainants alleged that the Respondent has control and influence over a group of companies known as New Borneo Agri ("the Sulaidy companies"), a non-RSPO member who was not declared in Respondent's RSPO Group Membership.
Status	Investigation / Deliberation
Decision / Justification	 The Independent Investigator is still in communication with the parties to have the NDA in place prior to circulating the draft investigation report for the factual verification process. The Respondent has signed the NDA as required by the Independent Investigator.



Complaint 3.4 PT Inecda (a subsidiary of S&G Biofuel Pte. Ltd) vs Requested for confidentiality **Case Reference** RSPO/2021/06/SW **Date Filed** 19 March 2021 Respondent PT Inecda (a subsidiary of S&G Biofuel Pte. Ltd) Membership Oil Palm Grower Category Country Indonesia Complainant Requested for confidentiality Complaint Respondent is operating in the area own by the Luak Talang Parit Community Description without obtaining prior consent from the community; • Respondent did not develop the plasma plantations for the community; and • Respondent did not have an internal grievance mechanism that the stakeholders can access **Status** Decision delivered with period to appeal (60 WD) Decision / 1. Decision delivered on 13.09.2024. Pending expiry of the appeals period. Justification



Complaint 3.5 Energy & Palma S.A. (subsidiary of HOLDING LA FABRIL S.A) vs Requested for confidentiality

Case Reference	RSPO/2023/01/MAM
Date Filed	05 January 2023
Respondent	Energy & Palma S.A. (a subsidiary of HOLDING LA FABRIL S.A)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Ecuador
Complainant	Requested for confidentiality
Complaint Description	 Allegations made against the Respondent are in relation to the modification of property deeds to remove areas identified by the government as community lands and environmental protection zones. Lawsuit against community owners to intimidate the local people. Company's activities have a negative impact on the natural environment and lead to degradation and deforestation.
Status	Investigation / Deliberation - Independent investigation
Decision / Justification	1. Independent Investigation by Independent Investigator ongoing.

The state of the s	Bumi Pratama Khatulistiwa (subsidiary of Wilmar International Limited) Requested for confidentiality
Case Reference	RSPO/2022/17/LSL
Date Filed	26 December 2022
Respondent	PT. Bumi Pratama Khatulistiwa (subsidiary of Wilmar International Limited)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Requested for confidentiality



Complaint Description	 Pertaining to labour related issues such as wages, no optimal health services and safety, (BPJS) is not registered, unilateral termination, the rights of the workers are not honoured, intimidation and expanded job scopes of workers (harvesters) It is further alleged that the workers who have been working for a period of more than 5 years are not converted to permanent workers, instead their working days were reduced, The Respondent is allegedly not transparent in determining Lembaga Kerjasama (LKS) bipartite and the amount of FFB delivered to the factory/mill.
Status	Investigation / Deliberation
Decision / Justification	 Revised Special Audit report received from the CB. The Secretariat is currently reviewing the said report.

Complaint 3.7 Energy & Palma S.A. (subsidiary of La Fabril Group) vs Requested for confidentiality	
Case Reference	RSPO/2023/09/MAM
Date Filed	16 May 2023
Respondent	Energy & Palma S.A. (subsidiary of La Fabril Group)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Ecuador
Complainant	Requested for confidentiality
Complaint Description	 Decrease of the number of workers in a union due to actions of the Respondent. Preventing the Union from conducting its activity. Wrongful dismissal or termination of employment. Bad working conditions. No supply of work equipment (such as tools).
Status	Investigation / Deliberation
Decision / Justification	 The Special Audit report was furnished to the parties for their perusal and comments. Both parties have responded with their comments. The Secretariat is in the midst of reviewing the responses.