

# **COMPLAINTS PANEL MINUTES OF MEETING**

for Website

Date: 25 June 2025 @ 5.00pm - 7.20pm

Meeting : via Zoom

MEMBERS OF THE COMPLAINTS PANEL
<ol> <li>Henry Barlow (Chair - CCP)</li> <li>Lim Sian Choo ( Co Chair)</li> <li>Michelle Desilets</li> <li>Marieke Leegwater</li> <li>Lanash Thanda</li> <li>Robert Kruger</li> <li>Florentine van den Eerenbeemt</li> <li>Priya Gopalan</li> <li>Carl Dagenhart</li> <li>Kartika Dewi</li> <li>Irene Aycinena Abascal</li> <li>Miguel Tejada Iraizoz</li> <li>Henky Satrio Wibowo</li> </ol>
14. Juliarta Bramansa Ottay 15. Bart W Van Assen
GENERAL AGENDA
<ol> <li>Opening Remarks by Chairperson</li> <li>RSPO Antitrust Guidelines</li> </ol>
3. Declaration of Conflict of Interest
4. To confirm and adopt the minutes of <b>28 May 2025</b> CP Meeting
<ul><li>5. New Allegations</li><li>6. Complaints Case Statistics</li></ul>
7. Complaints Panel Meeting Dates
<ul><li>7.1 Dates for CP Monthly Meetings</li><li>7.2 Dates for CP Physical Meetings</li><li>7.3 Expansion of the Complaints Panel</li></ul>



9. Dispute Settlement Facility (DSF)
10. Commitment of Financial Institutions.
11. 1st Internal Voluntary Review of the Complaints and Appeals Procedures
12. ASC-CP Joint Meeting
13. Complaints for deliberation
Group 1 - COMPLAINTS FOR DELIBERATION
<ol> <li>Poligrow Colombia S.A.S. vs Inversiones Chirajara S.A.S.</li> <li>NATURACEITES S. A. vs Requested for Confidentiality</li> <li>Palmas del Espino S.A. vs Requested for Confidentiality</li> <li>Compañía Palma Tica S.A. (a subsidiary of Compañía Industrial Aceitera Coto Cincuenta y Cuatro S.A.) vs Requested for Confidentiality</li> <li>INDUSTRIAS OLEOPALMA SA DE CV. (a subsidiary of Oleoquímica Mexicana SA de CV) vs Requested for Confidentiality</li> <li>OLEOFLORES S.A.S vs Requested for Confidentiality</li> </ol>
Group 2 - COMPLAINTS FOR DELIBERATION
<ol> <li>PT Citra Sawit Cemerlang (a subsidiary of Genting Plantations Berhad) vs Requested for Confidentiality</li> <li>PT Guntung Idamannusa (subsidiary of Musim Mas Holdings Pte. Ltd) vs Mr. S. Samsul Hadi (Kepala Desa Pelanduk)</li> </ol>
Group 3 - COMPLAINTS FOR DELIBERATION
<ol> <li>First Resources Limited vs Requested for Confidentiality</li> <li>Energy &amp; Palma S.A. (a subsidiary of HOLDING LA FABRIL S.A) vs Requested for Confidentiality</li> <li>PT. Bumi Pratama Khatulistiwa ( subsidiary of Wilmar International Limited) vs Requested for Confidentiality</li> <li>Energy &amp; Palma S.A. ( subsidiary of La Fabril Group) vs Requested for Confidentiality</li> </ol>



# **DETAILS OF THE AGENDA:**

No.	Agenda		
1.	Opening Remarks from Chairperson		
	Opening speech by CO	CP.	
2.	RSPO Antitrust Guide	lines	
	RSPO Antitrust Guide	lines were read to the CP.	
3.	Declaration of "No Co	onflict of Interest"	
	Two CP members dec	lared Conflict of Interests.	
4.	To confirm and adopt	the minutes of 28 May 2025 during the Complaints Panel Meeting	
	Minutes of 28 May 20	025 adopted unanimously.	
5.	New allegation subr	nitted	
5.1			
	RSPO/2025/04/RR	PT Citra Sawit Cemerlang (a subsidiary of Genting Plantations Berhad)	
	Complainant	Requested for confidentiality	
	Complaint received	17 June 2025	
	Location	West Kalimantan, Indonesia	
	Allegations	<ul> <li>The Complainant is representing an affected individual, who alleges that the affected individual's land was allegedly sold by a family member to the Respondent without the affected individual's consent. The affected individual allegedly owns the land as it was inherited from the individual's late father.</li> <li>It is further alleged that the Respondent and the individual's family member colluded with each other and violated the law in obtaining the land.</li> <li>The affected individual, when called to a mediation process between the Respondent and the local authorities including the police, was allegedly threatened by the police that the individual could be charged with a crime, which could result in imprisonment, should the</li> </ul>	

affected individual insist on defending their right to the land.

### Discussion on 25 June 2025:-

1. Initial Diagnosis is in progress.

# 6. Complaints Cases Statistics

### Total cases in 2025

Month	Complaints received	Country	Open	Closed	Rejected	Withdrawn
January	1	Papua New Guinea	0	0	1	0
February	1	Indonesia	0	1	0	0
March	0	-	0	0	0	0
April	0	-	0	0	0	0
May	1	Indonesia	0	0	1	0
June	1	Indonesia	1	0	0	0

# Total Active Cases by Country and Year (as of 23.06.2025)

Country	Active Cases	
Indonesia	5	
Colombia	2	
Ecuador 2		
Guatemala	1	
Peru	1	
Costa Rica	1	
Mexico	1	
TOTAL	13	

Year	Active Cases
2021	1
2022	1
2023	2
2024	8
2025	1
TOTAL	13



7.	Complaints Panel
7.1	Dates for Complaints Panel monthly meetings
	Discussion on 25 June 2025:-  1. CP Meeting dates for the rest of year 2025 have been scheduled.
7.2	Dates for Complaints Panel Physical Meetings
	Discussion on 25 June 2025:-
	1. The date for the next meeting is 2 November 2025 (Physical Meeting).
7.3	Expansion of Complaints Panel
	Discussion on 25 June 2025:-  1. No further updates at this juncture.
8.	Post Complaint's Monitoring
8.1	FELDA Global Venture - (Article by The Wall Street Journal)
	Discussion on 25 June 2025:-
	1. Pending receipt of a further document from the Respondent.



#### 8.2 Extractora de la Gloria SAS

Discussion on 25 June 2025:-

- 1. The Monthly Progress Report for the month of May 2025 has been uploaded on the RSPO Case Tracker.
- 2. Pending the outcome of the local judicial and administrative processes.

# 8.3 Golden Veroleum Liberia (GVL)

Discussion on 25 June 2025:-

1. Final directive issued to parties and the Independent Facilitator on 13.06.2025.

#### 8.4 Aceites Y Derivados Sociedad Anonima (ACEYDESA)

Discussion on 25 June 2025:-

1. Independent verification is in progress.

### 8.5 PT Perkebunan Nusantara V (PERSERO)

Discussion on 28 May 2025:-

- 1. The Respondent provided the fifth progress update regarding the ongoing legal proceedings by way of email on 16 June 2025.
- 2. It is noted that the Bangkinang District Court issued a decision on the legal proceedings on 28 May 2025. It was further indicated that the Complainant, through its legal representatives, filed an appeal with the High Court of Riau on 10 June 2025.
- 3. In light of the appeal lodged by the Complainant, the Secretariat will continue to monitor the legal proceedings.



#### 8.6 PT Inecda (a subsidiary of S&G BIOFUEL PTE. LTD)

Discussion on 25 June 2025:-

- 1. The CP has endorsed the plan and schedule provided by both parties for the implementation of the CP's directives pursuant to the CP's Decision Letter dated 13.09.2024.
- 2. Pending receipt of the Monthly Progress Report for the month of June 2025.

#### 8.7 PT Kartika Prima Cipta (a subsidiary of Golden Agri Resources)

Discussion on 25 June 2025:-

- 1. The Respondent sought clarification from the CP through the Secretariat on whether it may proceed with its New Planting Procedure (NPP) activities or otherwise, considering the CP's 2025 decision in this Complaint in relation to New Land Development.
- 2. The CP confirmed that the Respondent can proceed with its NPP activities but with strict adherence to the RSPO's NPP standards.
- 3. The Secretariat through its relevant unit will communicate the timeline regarding the review of the relevant HCV reports with the Respondent.
- 4. The Secretariat is in the midst of preparing the Briefing Note on the progress of the PCM.

#### 9. Dispute Settlement Facility (DSF)

Discussion on 25 June 2025:-

1. A sharing session for DSF Mediators proceeded as scheduled on 12 June 2025.

#### 10. Commitments of Financial Institution(s)

Discussion on 25 June 2025:-

- 1. The Chair of the RSPO Financial Institutions Consultative Group (FICG) has stepped down after 2 years of tenure.
- 2. The RSPO Secretariat will facilitate meetings and coordinate inputs from the FICG for relevant Steering Committees, Working Groups, and Task Forces.
- 3. The RSPO Secretariat will continue to focus on one-on-one engagements with non-RSPO member financial institutions to build a better understanding around the RSPO, from basic introductions to more advanced technical overviews of the RSPO's systems.



# 11. 1st Internal Voluntary Review of the Complaints and Appeals Procedures

Discussion on 25 June 2025:-

1. The next Steering Group Meeting has been scheduled for 16 July 2025.

### 12. ASC - CP JOINT MEETING

Discussion on 25 June 2025:-

1. The ASC-CP Joint Meeting Minutes has been published on the RSPO website.

### **COMPLAINTS FOR DELIBERATION:-**

#### **GROUP 1**

Complaint 1.1 Pol	igrow Colombia S.A.S. vs Inversiones Chirajara S.A.S.		
Case Reference	RSPO/2024/04/MAM		
Date Filed	18 March 2024		
Respondent	Poligrow Colombia S.A.S.		
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower		
Country	Colombia		
Complainant	Inversiones Chirajara S.A.S.		
Complaint Description	<ul> <li>The Respondent infringed a private property to do a firebreak.</li> <li>The Respondent destroyed part of the forest of the plot of land and affected the place where the Complainant's cattle were located.</li> <li>The Respondent did not comply with a conciliation agreement signed between the parties.</li> </ul>		
Status	Investigation / Deliberation		
Decision / Justification	<ol> <li>The Secretariat is in the midst of reviewing the audit report furnished to it.</li> </ol>		



Complaint 1.2 NA	ATURACEITES S. A. vs Requested for confidentiality			
Case Reference	RSPO/2024/06/MAM			
Date Filed	24 April 2024			
Respondent	NATURACEITES S. A.			
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower			
Country	Guatemala			
Complainant	Requested for confidentiality			
Complaint Description	<ul> <li>The Complainant alleges that the Respondent is affecting the compliance of the act on corporate due diligence obligations for the prevention of human right violations in the supply chain.</li> <li>The Respondent has abused the human rights of the indigenous population since the Company has carried out an unlawful seizure of land and water.</li> <li>The Respondent has not complied with labour law, because the Company has unjustifiably withheld the appropriate wage.</li> <li>Occupational health and safety regulations are not respected by the Respondent.</li> <li>The Complainant alleges that the improper disposal of waste made by the Respondent is affecting the environment of the area where the community lives.</li> </ul>			
Status	Investigation / Deliberation			
Decision / Justification	<ol> <li>The Secretariat is in the midst of reviewing the comments furnished by the Respondent on the draft Terms of Reference (ToR) for the Independent Investigation.</li> </ol>			

Complaint 1.3 Palmas del Espino S.A. vs Requested for confidentiality	
Case Reference	RSPO/2024/09/MAM
Date Filed	27 May 2024
Respondent	Palmas del Espino S.A.



Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower		
Country	Peru		
Complainant	Requested for confidentiality		
Complaint Description	<ul> <li>The Complainant alleges that the Respondent has acquired FFB using restrictive competition practices, which affects smallholders.</li> <li>The Respondent has omitted the RSPO antitrust guidelines.</li> </ul>		
Status	Investigation / Deliberation		
Decision / Justification	1. Pending receipt of an update on the special audit request.		

The state of the s	mpañía Palma Tica S.A. (a subsidiary of Compañía Industrial Aceitera to Cincuenta y Cuatro S.A.) vs Requested for confidentiality	
Case Reference	RSPO/2024/13/MAM	
Date Filed	11 September 2024	
Respondent	Compañía Palma Tica S.A. (a subsidiary of Compañía Industrial Aceitera Coto Cincuenta y Cuatro S.A.)	
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower	
Country	Costa Rica	
Complainant	Requested for confidentiality	
Complaint Description	<ul> <li>The Complainant alleges that the Respondent breached the obligations to the RSPO by ignoring the High Conservation Values (HCVs) that were identified during the New Planting Procedure (NPP) in 2013, when clearing land in a protected area to plant oil palm crops.</li> <li>It is alleged that this situation affected forest conservation, as an area that should have been protected according to Costa Rican law was deforested;</li> <li>The Complainant alleges that the area where the alleged deforestation took place has now been abandoned but the damage has not been remedied by the Respondent; and</li> <li>The Complainant alleges that the said act of deforestation not only violates</li> </ul>	



	the RSPO sustainability principles, but also has a significant negative impact on local biodiversity and the communities that depend on this ecosystem.
Status	Investigation / Deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. The Briefing Note is in progress.

The state of the s	IDUSTRIAS OLEOPALMA SA DE CV. (a subsidiary of Oleoquímica Mexicana A de CV) vs Requested for confidentiality
Case Reference	RSPO/2024/17/MAM
Date Filed	29 November 2024
Respondent	INDUSTRIAS OLEOPALMA SA DE CV. (a subsidiary of Oleoquímica Mexicana SA de CV)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	México
Complainant	Requested for confidentiality
Complaint Description	<ul> <li>The Complainant alleges that the Respondent has unjustifiably dismissed workers, deceiving them into resigning with the promise that they will be rehired;</li> <li>It is alleged that the Respondent did not pay the dismissed workers the full amount of compensation for early termination of contract, breaching Mexican federal labour law;</li> <li>The Respondent bribed the authorities to obtain the parcel certificate from the National Agrarian Registry (RAN) required by Mexican Law;</li> <li>It is alleged that the Respondent has falsified information regarding land ownership in order to use it as evidence to avoid the imposition of non-conformities during audits;</li> <li>The Complainant alleges that he was dismissed for reporting these practices to senior management; and,</li> <li>The Complainant alleges that crude oil palm is stored in tanks that do not receive any maintenance. Therefore, the Mexican legislation regulating this matter is not being complied with.</li> </ul>



Status	Investigation / Deliberation
Decision / Justification	<ol> <li>The CP has directed the Secretariat to engage an Independent Investigator/Expert to conduct an Independent Investigation on this Complaint.</li> </ol>

Complaint 1.6 OL	EOFLORES S.A.S vs Requested for confidentiality
Case Reference	RSPO/2024/18/HN
Date Filed	28 November 2024
Respondent	OLEOFLORES S.A.S
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Colombia
Complainant	Requested for confidentiality
Complaint Description	<ul> <li>The Complainant alleges that the Respondent owns and operates oil palm plantations on conflicted and contested rural lands in Montes de Maria.</li> <li>The Complainant alleges that the Respondent has diminished legal, customary and user rights in the region of Montes de María, without the FPIC of local communities.</li> <li>The Complainant alleges that the Respondent failed to fulfil its commitments to ensure transparency in providing the necessary information to interested parties.</li> <li>The Complainant alleges that the Respondent failed to fulfil its commitments to use peaceful dispute resolution mechanisms, not to instigate violence, to protect Human Rights Defenders and to prevent reprisals against them.</li> <li>The Complainant alleges that the Respondent conducted non-compliant land clearing, which resulted in the damage of High Conservation Value (HCV) areas and freshwater ecosystems in the region.</li> </ul>
Status	Investigation / Deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. Both Parties submitted their comments on the draft Terms of Reference (ToR) for the Independent Investigation.



- 2. These comments have been reviewed and considered by the Complaints Panel.
- 3. The Secretariat will proceed to finalise the ToR as endorsed by the CP and commence the Call for Expression of Interest.

### **GROUP 2**

Complaint 2.1	PT Citra Sawit Cemerlang (a subsidiary of Genting Plantations Berhad) vs Requested for confidentiality
Case Reference	RSPO/2024/03/LSL
Date Filed	04 March 2024
Respondent	PT Citra Sawit Cemerlang (a subsidiary of Genting Plantations Berhad)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Requested for confidentiality
Complaint Description	<ul> <li>Allegations revolve around land issues where the Complainant(s) were evicted by the Respondent from their agricultural land.</li> <li>There are elements of intimidation by the Respondent and local authorities in the process of resolving the disagreements on the aforementioned land dispute.</li> <li>The Respondent destroyed the irrigation built by the government.</li> </ul>
Status	Investigation/Deliberation - DSF mediation process
Decision / Justification	1. DSF Mediation in progress.



The second secon	Guntung Idamannusa (subsidiary of Musim Mas Holdings Pte. Ltd) vs r. S. Samsul Hadi (Kepala Desa Pelanduk)
Case Reference	RSPO/2024/14/RH
Date Filed	16 October 2024
Respondent	PT Guntung Idamannusa (subsidiary of Musim Mas Holdings Pte. Ltd)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Mr. S. Samsul Hadi (Kepala Desa Pelanduk)
Complaint Description	<ul> <li>The Respondent's Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) program is not concrete and sustainable for the surrounding community;</li> <li>The Respondent has conducted replanting/cutting down of oil palm trees on a plantation, resulting in the emergence of insect pests damaging the community's coconut plantation;</li> <li>The Respondent only provided pesticides twice and did not take responsibility for the community's coconut plantation damage; and</li> <li>The community's pesticide proposal through the Village Head was not urgently responded to by the Respondent, which caused the surrounding community to suffer great losses.</li> </ul>
Status	Investigation/Deliberation
Decision / Justification	<ol> <li>The draft Terms of Reference (ToR) for the independent investigation is in the midst of the CP's review.</li> </ol>



# **GROUP 3**

Complaint 3.1 Fi	rst Resources Limited vs Requested for confidentiality
Case Reference	RSPO/2021/04/EN
Date Filed	8 March 2021
Respondent	First Resources Limited
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Requested for confidentiality
Complaint Description	<ul> <li>The Respondent allegedly has ownership, control and influence over a company called Fangiono Agro Plantation (FAP) Agri, a non-RSPO member who was not declared in the Respondent's RSPO Group Membership.</li> <li>The Respondent also allegedly has ownership, control and influence of an Indonesian company, Ciliandry Anky Abadi (CAA) who is a subsidiary of a British Virgin Islands registered company by the name of Sima Capital. This company too was not declared to be a part of the Respondent's RSPO Group Membership.</li> <li>The Respondent, via FAP or by FAP's 11 subsidiaries have violated the RSPO Principles and Criteria by deforestation, peatland degradation, using lands for plantation without FPIC, river pollution, and unilateral layoffs of workers.</li> <li>The Respondent, via CAA, have violated the RSPO Principles and Criteria by deforestation, peatland degradation, using lands for plantation without FPIC, and river pollution.</li> <li>The Respondent is violating its NDPE Commitments, the RSPO Principle and Criteria, the RSPO Code of Conduct, and RSPO membership rules.</li> <li>The Complainants alleged that the Respondent has control and influence over a group of companies known as New Borneo Agri ("the Sulaidy companies"), a non-RSPO member who was not declared in Respondent's RSPO Group Membership.</li> </ul>
Status	Investigation / Deliberation
Decision / Justification	<ol> <li>The CP concluded its deliberations on 25.06.2025 and directed the Secretariat to draft a decision letter.</li> <li>The Secretariat is in the midst of drafting a decision letter.</li> </ol>



# Complaint 3.2 Energy & Palma S.A. ( subsidiary of HOLDING LA FABRIL S.A) vs Requested for confidentiality

Case Reference	RSPO/2023/01/MAM
Date Filed	05 January 2023
Respondent	Energy & Palma S.A. (a subsidiary of HOLDING LA FABRIL S.A)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Ecuador
Complainant	Requested for confidentiality
Complaint Description	<ul> <li>Allegations made against the Respondent are in relation to the modification of property deeds to remove areas identified by the government as community lands and environmental protection zones.</li> <li>Lawsuit against community owners to intimidate the local people.</li> <li>Company's activities have a negative impact on the natural environment and lead to degradation and deforestation.</li> </ul>
Status	Investigation / Deliberation - Independent investigation
Decision / Justification	1. The Secretariat is in the midst of drafting a decision letter.

	Bumi Pratama Khatulistiwa ( subsidiary of Wilmar International Limited) Requested for confidentiality
Case Reference	RSPO/2022/17/LSL
Date Filed	26 December 2022
Respondent	PT. Bumi Pratama Khatulistiwa ( subsidiary of Wilmar International Limited)



Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Requested for confidentiality
Complaint Description	<ul> <li>Pertaining to labour related issues such as wages, no optimal health services and safety, (BPJS) is not registered, unilateral termination, the rights of the workers are not honoured, intimidation and expanded job scopes of workers (harvesters)</li> <li>It is further alleged that the workers who have been working for a period of more than 5 years are not converted to permanent workers, instead their working days were reduced,</li> <li>The Respondent is allegedly not transparent in determining Lembaga Kerjasama (LKS) bipartite and the amount of FFB delivered to the factory/mill.</li> </ul>
Status	Investigation / Deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. The Secretariat is in the midst of drafting a decision letter.

Complaint 3.4 Energy & Palma S.A. ( subsidiary of La Fabril Group) vs Requested for confidentiality	
Case Reference	RSPO/2023/09/MAM
Date Filed	16 May 2023
Respondent	Energy & Palma S.A. ( subsidiary of La Fabril Group)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Ecuador
Complainant	Requested for confidentiality
Complaint Description	<ul> <li>Decrease of the number of workers in a union due to actions of the Respondent.</li> <li>Preventing the Union from conducting its activity.</li> <li>Wrongful dismissal or termination of employment.</li> <li>Bad working conditions.</li> </ul>



	No supply of work equipment ( such as tools).
Status	Investigation / Deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. The CP is in the midst of reviewing the draft decision letter.