

COMPLAINTS PANEL MINUTES OF MEETING

for Website

Date: 26 June 2024 @ 5.00pm - 6.40pm

Meeting : via Zoom

MEMBERS OF THE COMPLAINTS PANEL
 Henry Barlow (Chair - CCP) Lim Sian Choo (Co Chair) Michelle Desilets Marieke Leegwater Lanash Thanda Robert Kruger Florentine van den Eerenbeemt Priya Gopalan Carl Dagenhart Kartika Dewi Irene Aycinena Abascal Miguel Tejada Iraizoz Henky Satrio Wibowo Juliarta Bramansa Ottay
GENERAL AGENDA
 Opening Remarks by Chairperson RSPO Antitrust Guidelines Declaration of Conflict of Interest To confirm and adopt the minutes of 29 May 2024 CP Meeting New Allegations Complaints Case Statistics Complaints Panel Meeting Dates 7.1 Dates for CP Monthly Meetings 7.2 Dates for CP Physical Meetings 7.3 Expansion of the Complaints Panel Post Complaints Monitoring



 9. Dispute Settlement Facility (DSF) 10. Commitment of Financial Institutions. 11. 1st Internal Voluntary Review of the Complaints and Appeals Procedures 12. ASC-CP Joint Meeting 13. Complaints for deliberation
Group 1 - COMPLAINTS FOR DELIBERATION
 PT. Sari Dumai Sejati (a subsidiary of AAA Oils and Fats Pte Ltd (APICAL Group) vs Mr. Hidayat Rasyid PT. Cipta Davia Mandiri (a subsidiary of R.E.A. Holdings Plc) vs Requested for Confidentiality PT Grahadura Leidong Prima (a subsidiary of PT. Bakrie Sumatera Plantations TBK) vs Requested for Confidentiality PT. Cipta Davia Mandiri (a subsidiary of R.E.A. Holdings Plc) vs Requested for Confidentiality PT. Cipta Davia Mandiri (a subsidiary of R.E.A. Holdings Plc) vs Requested for Confidentiality Poligrow Colombia S.A.S. vs Inversiones Chirajara S.A.S. NATURACEITES S. A. vs Requested for Confidentiality
Group 2 - COMPLAINTS FOR DELIBERATION
 PT. Perkebunan Nusantara V (PERSERO) vs Requested for Confidentiality PT. Tunggal Mitra Plantation (a subsidiary of Sime Darby Plantation Berhad) vs Requested for Confidentiality PT Citra Sawit Cemerlang (a subsidiary of Genting Plantations Berhad) Requested for Confidentiality PT Swadaya Mukti Prakarsa (a subsidiary of First Resources Limited) vs Requested for Confidentiality
Group 3 - COMPLAINTS FOR DELIBERATION
 PT. Kartika Prima Cipta (PT. KPC) - subsidiary of Golden Agri Resources (GAR) vs Forest Peoples Programme & TuK Indonesia Golden Agri Resources (GAR) vs Forest Peoples Programme & Elk Hills Foundation Aceites Y Derivados Sociedad Anonima (ACEYDESA) vs Requested for Confidentiality



 First Resources Limited vs Requested for Confidentiality PT Inecda (a subsidiary of S&G Biofuel Pte. Ltd) vs Requested for Confidentiality Grasas Y Derivados S.A. Gradesa S.A vs Requested for Confidentiality Energy & Palma S.A. (a subsidiary of HOLDING LA FABRIL S.A) vs Requested for Confidentiality
 PT. Bumi Pratama Khatulistiwa (subsidiary of Wilmar International Limited) vs Requested for Confidentiality Energy & Palma S.A. (subsidiary of La Fabril Group) vs Requested for Confidentiality



DETAILS OF THE AGENDA:

No.	Agenda
1.	Opening Remarks from Chairperson
	Opening speech by CCP.
2.	RSPO Antitrust Guidelines
	RSPO Antitrust Guidelines were read to the CP.
3.	Declaration of "No Conflict of Interest"
	No further Conflict of Interest declared at this time of the meeting.
4.	To confirm and adopt the minutes of 29 May 2024 during the Complaints Panel Meeting
	Minutes of 29 May 2024 adopted unanimously.

5. New allegation submitted

5.1

RSPO/2024/09/MAM Palmas del Espino S.A.	
Complainant	Requested for confidentiality
Complaint received	27 May 2024
Location	Peru
Allegations	 The Complainant alleges that the Respondent has acquired FFB using restrictive competition practices, which affect smallholders. Omission of the antitrust guidelines.

Discussion on 26 June 2024:-

1. Initial Diagnosis is in progress.

6. Complaints Cases Statistics



Total cases in 2024

Month	Complaints received	Country	Open	Closed	Rejected	Withdrawn
January	1	Indonesia	1	0	0	0
February	1	Indonesia	1	0	0	0
March	3	Indonesia (2) Colombia	3	0	0	0
April	3	Guatemala	3	0	0	0
May	1	Peru	1	0	0	0
June	0	0	0	0	0	0

Total Active Cases by Country and Year (as of 24.06.2024)

Country	Active Cases	
Indonesia	13	
Colombia	2	
Honduras	1	
Ecuador	2	
Guatemala	1	
Peru	1	
TOTAL	20	

Year	Active Cases
2014	1
2020	2
2021	2
2022	3
2023	5
2024	7
TOTAL	20

7. Complaints Panel

7.1 Dates for Complaints Panel monthly meetings

Discussion on 26 June 2024:-

1. CP meetings dates until the end of 2024 have been scheduled.



7.2	Dates for Complaints Panel Physical Meetings
	Discussion on 26 June 2024:- 1. The Secretariat has issued a doodle poll to the CP members to identify a suitable date.
7.3	Expansion of Complaints Panel
	Discussion on 26 June 2024:-
	1. No further updates.
8.	Post Complaint's Monitoring
8.1	FELDA Global Venture - (Article by The Wall Street Journal)
	Discussion on 26 June 2024:-
	1. Pending receipt of a further document from the Respondent.
8.2	Extractora de la Gloria SAS
	Discussion on 26 June 2024:-
	1. Pending outcome of the local judicial and administrative processes.
8.3	Golden Veroleum Liberia (GVL)
	Discussion on 26 June 2024:-
	1. Directives for the Tarjuowon area released to parties and the Independent Facilitator.
	2. Draft report on the findings of the implementation of the CP's decision in Sinoe furnished to the CP.
	3. Secretariat to schedule an Ad-hoc meeting and invite the Independent Facilitator for further discussions with the CP.
8.4	PT. Bumitama Gunajaya Agro (subsidiary of Bumitama Agri Ltd)
	Discussion on 26 June 2024:-
	1. Pending clarifications from the Respondent on the Secretariat's queries regarding the progress update for June 2024.



9.	Dispute Settlement Facility (DSF)
	Discussion on 26 June 2024:- 1. The Secretariat is in the midst of finalising the appointment for DSF Mediators. Next DSF GoA online meeting is scheduled on 03 July 2024.
10.	Commitments of Financial Institution(s)
	Discussion on 26 June 2024:- 1. The CP members were briefed on the Secretariat's efforts in its engagements with the FI sector.
11.	1st Internal Voluntary Review of the Complaints and Appeals Procedures
	Discussion on 26 June 2024:- 1. Revised draft Report on Recommendations and document on consensus points furnished to the Steering Group for their perusal and comments.
12.	ASC - CP JOINT MEETING
	Discussion on 26 June 2024:- 1. Joint online meeting between the Co-Chairs of the ASC & CP proceeded on 31.05.2024 as scheduled. Material presented during the meeting have been furnished to the attendees and will be circulated amongst the CP members.



COMPLAINTS FOR DELIBERATION:-

GROUP 1

	. Sari Dumai Sejati (a subsidiary of AAA Oil and Fats Pte Ltd (APICAL Group) Mr. Hidayat Rasyid	
Case Reference	RSPO/2023/12/RR	
Date Filed	03 August 2023	
Respondent	PT. Sari Dumai Sejati (a subsidiary of AAA Oils and Fats Pte Ltd (APICAL Group)	
Membership Category	Processors and / or Traders	
Country	Indonesia	
Complainant	Mr. Hidayat Rasyid	
Complaint Description	 The Complainant is a representative of a community, and the Respondent is a Crude Palm Oil producer. Allegations are with regards to unsustainable operations at the Respondent's plant, causing severe air and noise pollution, disrupting and affecting the daily lives of the community. 	
Status	Investigation / Deliberation	
Decision / Justification	1. Pending further clarification from Respondent on the Complaints Panel's queries.	

Complaint 1.2 PT Cipta Davia Mandiri (a subsidiary of R.E.A. Holdings Plc) vs Requested for confidentiality		
Case Reference	RSPO/2023/14/HN	
Date Filed	14 November 2023	
Respondent	PT Cipta Davia Mandiri (a subsidiary of R.E.A. Holdings Plc)	
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower	
Country	Indonesia	



Complainant	Requested for confidentiality
Complaint Description	• The Complainant alleges that the Respondent's plasma allocation and development is not in accordance with the MoU or agreement between the Respondent and the community of Kelinjau Ulu Village.
Status	Decision delivered with period to appeal (60 WD)
Decision / Justification	1. Pending expiry of the appeals period.

Complaint 1.3 PT Grahadura Leidong Prima (a subsidiary of PT Bakrie Sumatera Plantations TBK) vs Requested for confidentiality	
Case Reference	RSPO/2023/15/HN
Date Filed	23 November 2023
Respondent	PT Grahadura Leidong Prima (a subsidiary of PT Bakrie Sumatera Plantations TBK)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Requested for confidentiality
Complaint Description	• The Complainant alleges that the Respondent has yet to fulfil the commitment to allocate plasma land to the community.
Status	Investigation / Deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. The draft Terms of Reference (ToR) for the Independent Investigation was endorsed by the Complaints Panel and the same was furnished to both Parties to the Complaint on 25 June 2024 for their perusal and comments on or before 10 July 2024.



	Cipta Davia Mandiri (a subsidiary of R.E.A.Holdings Plc) vs Requested for nfidentiality
Case Reference	RSPO/2024/01/LSL
Date Filed	8 January 2024
Respondent	PT Cipta Davia Mandiri (a subsidiary of R.E.A. Holdings Plc)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Requested for confidentiality
Complaint Description	 The allegation is pertaining to the plasma allocation with the ratio of 80:20 based on the plasma agreement. The affected parties have not received the 20% share of the revenue generated from the plasma land since 2010 till date.
Status	Investigation / Deliberation - Bilateral Engagement process
Decision / Justification	 Third BE meeting proceeded on 25 June 2024. Parties reached an agreement and the same was furnished to the Secretariat. The Secretariat is in the midst of reviewing the same.

Complaint 1.5 Poligrow Colombia S.A.S. vs Inversiones Chirajara S.A.S.	
Case Reference	RSPO/2024/04/MAM
Date Filed	18 March 2024
Respondent	Poligrow Colombia S.A.S.
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Colombia



Complainant	Inversiones Chirajara S.A.S.
Complaint Description	 The Respondent infringed a private property to do a firebreak. The Respondent destroyed part of the forest of the plot of land and affected the place where the Complainant's cattle were located. The Respondent did not comply with a conciliation agreement signed between the parties.
Status	Investigation / Deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. The Respondent responded with the requested details by the Secretariat, and the Secretariat is in the midst of reviewing the same.

Complaint 1.6 NA	TURACEITES S. A. vs Requested for confidentiality
Case Reference	RSPO/2024/06/MAM
Date Filed	24 April 2024
Respondent	NATURACEITES S. A.
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Guatemala
Complainant	Requested for confidentiality
Complaint Description	 The Complainant alleges that the Respondent is affecting the compliance of the act on corporate due diligence obligations for the prevention of human right violations in the supply chain. The Respondent has abused the human rights of the indigenous population since the Company has carried out an unlawful seizure of land and water. The Respondent has not complied with labour law, because the Company has unjustifiably withheld the appropriate wage. Occupational health and safety regulations are not respected by the Respondent. The Complainant alleges that the improper disposal of waste made by the Respondent is affecting the environment of the area where the community lives.
Status	Investigation / Deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. The formal acceptance of the Complaint was communicated to the Parties on 13.06.2024.



2. The Secretariat is in the midst of reviewing the redacted version of the Complainant's submission.

GROUP 2

Complaint 2.1 PT. Perkebunan Nusantara V (PERSERO) vs Requested for confidentiality	
Case Reference	RSPO/2022/03/CRP
Date Filed	04 March 2022
Respondent	PT. Perkebunan Nusantara V (PERSERO)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Requested for confidentiality
Complaint Description	 The Respondent is alleged of illegally controlling some of the KKPA (Primary Member Cooperative Credit) objects, as well as violating the KKPA agreement. The Respondent is alleged of embezzling funds and fraud in the development of oil palm plantations. The Respondent is alleged of violating the agreement related to the sale of the farmers' fruits which should have been disbursed to the Complainant to be distributed to its members and illegal bailout funds.
Status	Decision delivered with period to appeal (60 WD)
Decision / Justification	 An action plan has been requested to be furnished by the Respondent within three (3) months from the date of the decision letter. Pending receipt of the action plan from the Respondent. Pending expiry of the appeals period.

Complaint 2.2 PT Tunggal Mitra Plantation (a subsidiary of SD Guthrie Berhad) vs Requested for confidentiality	
Case Reference	RSPO/2024/02/RR
Date Filed	23 February 2024
Respondent	PT. Tunggal Mitra Plantation (a subsidiary of SD Guthrie Berhad)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower



Country	Riau, Indonesia
Complainant	Requested for confidentiality
Complaint Description	• Alleged failure by the Respondent Company to carry out its corporate social responsibility with regard to community empowerment and building a sustainable partnership with the community.
Status	Investigation/Deliberation - (Bilateral Engagement process)
Decision / Justification	1. Bilateral Engagement process ongoing.

Complaint 2.3 PT Citra Sawit Cemerlang (a subsidiary of Genting Plantations Berhad) vs Requested for confidentiality	
Case Reference	RSPO/2024/03/LSL
Date Filed	04 March 2024
Respondent	PT Citra Sawit Cemerlang (a subsidiary of Genting Plantations Berhad)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Kalimantan Barat, Indonesia
Complainant	Requested for confidentiality
Complaint Description	 Allegations revolve around land issues where the Complainant(s) were evicted by the Respondent from their agricultural land. There are elements of intimidation by the Respondent and local authorities in the process of resolving the disagreements on the aforementioned land dispute. The Respondent destroyed the irrigation built by the government.
Status	Investigation/Deliberation
Decision / Justification	 Complainant is in the midst of preparing a confirmation letter for their decision to pursue DSF Mediation. Pending receipt of the aforementioned letter.



	Swadaya Mukti Prakarsa (a subsidiary of First Resources Limited) vs equested for confidentiality
Case Reference	RSPO/2024/05/RR
Date Filed	20 March 2024
Respondent	PT Swadaya Mukti Prakarsa (a subsidiary of First Resources Limited)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Kalimantan Barat, Indonesia
Complainant	Requested for confidentiality
Complaint Description	 Allegations raised against the Respondent are pertaining to a variety of workers rights violations, such as poor working conditions, non-provisions of subsidy, non-payment of social security (BPJS), poor safety conditions, workers health, unreasonable working hours, amongst others. The Complainant also alleged that several of its workers had been arrested by the police, for protesting against the Respondent company pertaining to their rights.
Status	Investigation/Deliberation
Decision / Justification	 Parties responded to the Secretariat on their choice of using the alternative dispute resolution methods (i.e Bilateral Engagement or DSF Mediation) to resolve the Complaint amicably. Respondent to furnish formal response on/before 28.06.2024.



GROUP 3

Complaint 3.1 PT. Kartika Prima Cipta (GAR) vs Forest Peoples Programme & TuK	
Case Reference	PreCAP/2014/03/IR
Date Filed	13 October 2014
Respondent	PT. Kartika Prima Cipta (PT.KPC) - Golden Agri Resources (GAR)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia – Kapuas Hulu, West Kalimantan
Complainant	Forest Peoples Programme (FPP) and (Transformasi untuk Keadilan) TuK Indonesia
Complaint Description	 Points raised:- PT KPC is in persistent violation of the RSPO P&C pertaining HCV assessment, the recognition of customary land rights and free, prior, and informed consent (FPIC). Lack of FPIC of the local Dayak and Malay people in the process of land take over. Land takeover was done without land tenure study and participatory mapping. Late HCV assessment which was done by IPB, final consultation was in May 2014. Dissatisfaction by smallholders and resentment because of reduced post facto set aside for HCV rather than getting plasma scheme (20%). Set aside land as HCS area that made no provision for customary land uses and tenure and local people livelihood. GAR as the parent company of all 18 subsidiaries listed in acting in violation of the New Planting Procedure (NPP) by submitting information which is known as false. No HGU in 16 of 18 NPP. The assessors which have endorsed GAR's HCV assessment, ESIAs and social engagement actions, are in violation of their responsibility to provide impartial assessment of company compliance with RSPO P&C.
Status	Investigation / Deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. The CP endorsed the Secretariat's proposal to proceed with the drafting of the decision letter.



	olden Agri Resources (GAR) vs Forest Peoples Programme & Elk Hills oundation
Case Reference	RSPO/2020/04/IR
Date Filed	2 March 2020
Respondent	Golden Agri Resource (GAR)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Forest Peoples Programme & Elk Hills Foundation
Complaint Description	 The Respondent, through its subsidiaries located in Central Kalimantan, operate its plantations with permits which never had the force of law; The Respondent, through its employees have been involved in the payment of bribes to provincial officials in Central Kalimantan.
Status	Investigation / Deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. Briefing Note under peer review prior submission to the Complaints Panel.

Complaint 3.3 Aceites Y Derivados Sociedad Anonima (ACEYDESA) vs Requested for confidentiality	
Case Reference	RSPO/2020/07/LSL
Date Filed	6 April 2020
Respondent	Aceites Y Derivados Sociedad Anonima (ACEYDESA)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Honduras
Complainant	Requested for confidentiality
Complaint Description	 Modification of property deeds to remove areas identified by the government as environmental protection zone; Employees not paid minimum wage; not provided with equipment; and not



	 given workers' benefits; Non-compliance with labour laws; Threatening of workers to suppress information from auditors; Bribing workers and government agencies; Manipulation of scale systems; Falsification of data; Operating without an environmental license.
Status	Decision delivered with period to appeal (60 WD)
Decision / Justification	 Pending endorsement of the Respondent's action plan by the Complaints Panel. Pending expiry of the appeals period.

Complaint 3.4 F	irst Resources Limited vs Requested for confidentiality
Case Reference	RSPO/2021/04/EN
Date Filed	8 March 2021
Respondent	First Resources Limited
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Requested for confidentiality
Complaint Description	 The Respondent allegedly has ownership, control and influence over a company called Fangiono Agro Plantation (FAP) Agri, a non-RSPO member who was not declared in the Respondent's RSPO Group Membership. The Respondent also allegedly has ownership, control and influence of an Indonesian company, Ciliandry Anky Abadi (CAA) who is a subsidiary of a British Virgin Islands registered company by the name of Sima Capital. This company too was not declared to be a part of the Respondent's RSPO Group Membership. The Respondent, via FAP or by FAP's 11 subsidiaries have violated the RSPO Principles and Criteria by deforestation, peatland degradation, using lands for plantation without FPIC, river pollution, and unilateral layoffs of workers. The Respondent, via CAA, have violated the RSPO Principles and Criteria by deforestation, using lands for plantation without FPIC, and river pollution.



	 The Respondent is violating its NDPE Commitments, the RSPO Principle and Criteria, the RSPO Code of Conduct, and RSPO membership rules. The Complainants alleged that the Respondent has control and influence over a group of companies known as New Borneo Agri ("the Sulaidy companies"), a non-RSPO member who was not declared in Respondent's RSPO Group Membership.
Status	Investigation / Deliberation
Decision / Justification	 The Independent Investigator's draft report is expected to be submitted early July 2024. Upon receipt, the draft report will be furnished to the Complaints Panel for perusal before being furnished to the Parties for factual verification (subject to confidentiality requirements by the Independent Investigator).

Complaint 3.5 PT	Inecda (a subsidiary of S&G Biofuel Pte. Ltd) vs Requested for confidentiality
Case Reference	RSPO/2021/06/SW
Date Filed	19 March 2021
Respondent	PT Inecda (a subsidiary of S&G Biofuel Pte. Ltd)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Requested for confidentiality
Complaint Description	 Respondent is operating in the area own by the Luak Talang Parit Community without obtaining prior consent from the community; Respondent did not develop the plasma plantations for the community; and Respondent did not have an internal grievance mechanism that the stakeholders can access
Status	Investigation / Deliberation



Decision /	1. Briefing Note submitted to the Complaints Panel.
Justification	2. An Ad hoc meeting is to be scheduled in July 2024 to deliberate on the
	contents of the Briefing Note.

Complaint 3.6 G	rasas Y Derivados S.A. Gradesa S.A. vs Requested for confidentiality Adjourned
Case Reference	RSPO/2022/14/MAM
Date Filed	03 November 2022
Respondent	Grasas Y Derivados S.A. Gradesa S.A.
Membership Category	Processors and / or Traders
Country	Colombia
Complainant	Requested for confidentiality
Complaint Description	 Prosecution of union workers in order to lay off them and weaken the union. Infringement of constitutional rights, because the company is affecting the right of union association. Dismissals of labour contracts without a fair cause.
Status	Investigation / Deliberation - (Adjourned)
Decision / Justification	1. Adjourned pending the outcome of the proceedings before the Ministry of Labour.



	ergy & Palma S.A. (subsidiary of HOLDING LA FABRIL S.A) vs Requested for infidentiality
Case Reference	RSPO/2023/01/MAM
Date Filed	05 January 2023
Respondent	Energy & Palma S.A. (a subsidiary of HOLDING LA FABRIL S.A)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Ecuador
Complainant	Requested for confidentiality
Complaint Description	 Allegations made against the Respondent are in relation to the modification of property deeds to remove areas identified by the government as community lands and environmental protection zones. Lawsuit against community owners to intimidate the local people. Company's activities have a negative impact on the natural environment and lead to degradation and deforestation.
Status	Investigation / Deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. Independent Investigator engaged and Independent Investigation commenced.

	. Bumi Pratama Khatulistiwa (subsidiary of Wilmar International Limited) Requested for confidentiality
Case Reference	RSPO/2022/17/LSL
Date Filed	26 December 2022
Respondent	PT. Bumi Pratama Khatulistiwa (subsidiary of Wilmar International Limited)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Requested for confidentiality



Complaint Description	 Pertaining to labour related issues such as wages, no optimal health services and safety, (BPJS) is not registered, unilateral termination, the rights of the workers are not honoured, intimidation and expanded job scopes of workers (harvesters) It is further alleged that the workers who have been working for a period of more than 5 years are not converted to permanent workers, instead their working days were reduced, The Respondent is allegedly not transparent in determining Lembaga Kerjasama (LKS) bipartite and the amount of FFB delivered to the factory/mill.
Status	Investigation / Deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. Pending receipt of the special audit report by the newly appointed CB.

	Energy & Palma S.A. (subsidiary of La Fabril Group) vs Requested for confidentiality
Case Reference	RSPO/2023/09/MAM
Date Filed	16 May 2023
Respondent	Energy & Palma S.A. (subsidiary of La Fabril Group)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Ecuador
Complainant	Requested for confidentiality
Complaint Description	 Decrease of the number of workers in a union due to actions of the Respondent. Preventing the Union from conducting its activity. Wrongful dismissal or termination of employment. Bad working conditions. No supply of work equipment (such as tools).
Status	Investigation / Deliberation
Decision / Justification	 The Certification Unit has received the directive to refer to the CB to perform a special audit. Pending performance of the special audit by the CB.