

15th Meeting of RSPO Biodiversity and HCV Working Group (BHCV WG)				
Date	November 21, 2011 (Monday)			
Venue	Meeting room#7, Sutera Magellan, Kota Kinabalu, Sabah			
Attendance	Sophie Persey (SP)	ZSL	Co-Chair	
	Laura Darcy	ZSL	Member (alternate)	
	Simon Siburat (SS)	MPOA	Member	
	Calley Beamish (CB)	MPOA	Member (alternate)	
	Oliver Tichit (OT)	Sipef Group	Member	
	Anders Lindhe (AL)	WWF-International	Member	
	Dwi R. Muhtaman (DM)	Aksenta	Member	
	Reza Azmi (RA)	Wild Asia	Member	
	Marcus Colchester (MC)	Forest Peoples Programme	Member	
	Catherine Cassagne (CC)	IFC	Member	
	Norazam Abdul Hameed (NH)	Sime Darby	Invited	
	Stan Rodger (SR)	LPF-Shemsi Sdn Bhd	Observer	
	Mohamed Pirabaharan (MP)	PT. Minamas, Sime Darby	Observer	
	Ibrahim Abdul Majid (IM)	PT. Minamas, Sime Darby	Observer	
	BACP presenters:			
	Lee Gross	BACP	Invited	
	Gunung Gea	Pan Eco	Invited	
	Graham Usher	Pan Eco	Invited	
	Dewis Ruysschaert	Pan Eco	Invited	
	Mohammad Tanwier Mahdi	Member of Aceh Province	Invited	
	Anne Rosenbarger	WRI	Invited	
	Ariana Alisjahbana	WRI	Invited	
	Rauf Prasadjo	WRI	Invited	
	Moray Mcleish	WRI	Invited	
	Beth Gingold	WRI	Invited	
	Darmawan Liswanto	FFI	Invited	
	Dr. Stephen Browne	FFI-Singapore	Invited	
	Anna Lyons	FFI-Singapore	Invited	
	Cahyo Nugroho	FFI	Invited	
	Elizabeth Clarke	ZSL	Invited	
Michael Zurst (MZ)	ZSL	Invited		
Asril Darussamin (AD)	Technical and Smallholders Manager	Secretariat		
Audrey Lee Mei Fong (ALMF)	RSPO Biodiversity and Conservation Manager	Secretariat		
Absence	Henry S. Barlow	Sime Darby	Chair	

with Apology	Adam Harrison (AH)	WWF	Executive Board (EB) member																																																								
	Tim Killeen	Conservation International	Member																																																								
	Gan Lian Tong	PT Musim Mas	Member																																																								
Absence	Devan Subramaniam (DS)	WWF-MY	Member																																																								
	Irwan Gunawan	WWF-ID	Invited																																																								
	Purwo Susanto	ISPO Consulting	Member																																																								
Agenda	<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Schedule</th> <th>Agenda</th> <th>Person In-charge</th> <th>Requested Actions/ Decision</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>1030-1100</td> <td>Morning tea break</td> <td></td> <td rowspan="3">NA</td> </tr> <tr> <td rowspan="2">1100 – 1230</td> <td>Welcoming remarks from the chairperson</td> <td rowspan="2">SP</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Introduction of invited members</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="4">Main agenda items:-</td> </tr> <tr> <td rowspan="2">1100 – 1230</td> <td>Review previous minutes (BHCV WG meeting on 4th Oct 2011, Jakarta)</td> <td>SP</td> <td rowspan="2">NA</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Presentation by BACP's grantees (FFI, PanEco, WRI and ZSL) and discussion</td> <td>BACP: Lee Gross</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1230-1330</td> <td colspan="3">Lunch break</td> </tr> <tr> <td rowspan="9">1330-1700</td> <td>BHCV WG Proposal on P&C revision</td> <td>SP</td> <td>Proposal for criterion review/ issues</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Submission of time bound commitment for code of conduct implementation</td> <td>SP</td> <td>Proposal for new EB instruction on code of conduct</td> </tr> <tr> <td>HCV Compensation guideline and position statement</td> <td>Olivier Tichit</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Quality of HCV assessment and consistency of HCV interpretation</td> <td>Anders Lindhe</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="4">Tea break</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Sime Darby stage 2 report & update on stage 3</td> <td>Norazam Hameed</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Contract on HCV training modules by HCV RN</td> <td>ALMF</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>HCV assessors applications</td> <td>ALMF</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="4">Any other business (AOB)</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>			Schedule	Agenda	Person In-charge	Requested Actions/ Decision	1030-1100	Morning tea break		NA	1100 – 1230	Welcoming remarks from the chairperson	SP	Introduction of invited members	Main agenda items:-				1100 – 1230	Review previous minutes (BHCV WG meeting on 4th Oct 2011, Jakarta)	SP	NA	Presentation by BACP's grantees (FFI, PanEco, WRI and ZSL) and discussion	BACP: Lee Gross	1230-1330	Lunch break			1330-1700	BHCV WG Proposal on P&C revision	SP	Proposal for criterion review/ issues	Submission of time bound commitment for code of conduct implementation	SP	Proposal for new EB instruction on code of conduct	HCV Compensation guideline and position statement	Olivier Tichit		Quality of HCV assessment and consistency of HCV interpretation	Anders Lindhe		Tea break				Sime Darby stage 2 report & update on stage 3	Norazam Hameed		Contract on HCV training modules by HCV RN	ALMF		HCV assessors applications	ALMF		Any other business (AOB)			
	Schedule	Agenda	Person In-charge	Requested Actions/ Decision																																																							
	1030-1100	Morning tea break		NA																																																							
	1100 – 1230	Welcoming remarks from the chairperson	SP																																																								
		Introduction of invited members																																																									
	Main agenda items:-																																																										
	1100 – 1230	Review previous minutes (BHCV WG meeting on 4th Oct 2011, Jakarta)	SP	NA																																																							
		Presentation by BACP's grantees (FFI, PanEco, WRI and ZSL) and discussion	BACP: Lee Gross																																																								
	1230-1330	Lunch break																																																									
	1330-1700	BHCV WG Proposal on P&C revision	SP	Proposal for criterion review/ issues																																																							
		Submission of time bound commitment for code of conduct implementation	SP	Proposal for new EB instruction on code of conduct																																																							
		HCV Compensation guideline and position statement	Olivier Tichit																																																								
		Quality of HCV assessment and consistency of HCV interpretation	Anders Lindhe																																																								
		Tea break																																																									
		Sime Darby stage 2 report & update on stage 3	Norazam Hameed																																																								
Contract on HCV training modules by HCV RN		ALMF																																																									
HCV assessors applications		ALMF																																																									
Any other business (AOB)																																																											

1) Welcoming Remarks, Introduction, Acceptance of Agenda and Minutes Review

Meeting started at 11.00am. SP welcomed all participants and members of BHCV WG. She informed BHCV WG that she will be leaving ZSL; MZ is selected as the new representative for ZSL in BHCV WG.

The agenda was accepted and SP reminded all member of BHCV WG that the close discussion will start after the BACP grantees' presentation.

SR pointed out that the compensation discussion was not included in the minutes of 14th BHCV WG meeting. OT explained that the discussion was captured in the minutes of 2nd CTF meeting. Minutes of 14th BHCV WG meeting was accepted. **Action: ALMF to circulate minutes of 2nd CTF meeting.**

2) BACP Grantees' Presentation

BACP grantees: FFI

MC asked about the recommendation to address one of the challenges identified in this project i.e. lack of social commitment. According to FFI, the organization is engaging with the local community, although the government has the 80-20 ruling for plasma smallholders but it is not realizing on the ground. It was proposed that REDD+ could be one of the new finance opportunity for HCV areas. OT informed the group that the only type of license eligible for REDD+ project is the forestry license. DM highlighted on the issue of connecting HCV areas located within different concessions.

BACP grantees: Pan Eco

CB asked about the project area and it was explained by Pan Eco that the 67ha project site is the model for organic oil palm planting by smallholders. SS questioned on the reason for organic planting on degraded land which is often low in fertility. Pan Eco explained that the degraded land meant to be grassland/ open area which might still be fertile and organic cultivation will serve a niche market with higher value for the product.

RA asked on the limited HCV area and its function, Pan Eco explained that most of the area in Sumatra contains HCVs. AD added that the real issues concerning smallholders certification are poverty alleviation and HCV conservation.

Currently, there is no RSPO certified mill around the project area. SS mentioned that the minimum FFB supply base to establish a 30 tonne mill is about 6,000ha.

BACP grantees: ZSL

SP requested members of BHCV to comment on the practical handbook for conserving HCV species and habitats in oil palm landscapes.

BACP grantees: WRI

RA asked on the possibility to publish the mapping tool and RSPO could adopt the tool to share information on HCV assessments. CB added that this web mapping tool can be used by the companies to conduct due diligence and to assess the value of the land for compensation, but she also pointed out that the data accuracy is very important. WRI said the mapping exercise include criteria such as peat land, forest cover, risk on erosion and also the forest carbon analyser since Nov 2005, the data was sourced from Forestry Department and there are different versions of map provided by different agencies. WRI welcomes further discussion on the application of the mapping tool for RSPO monitoring.

BACP program evaluation”

LG presented on the BACP projects monitoring using the standard BACP indicators, outputs, outcomes and impacts. CC stressed that all grantees are requested to complete the project document, and the M&E will assist the organizations to communicate and measure the impacts on the ground.

3) BHCV Proposal for P&C Review

P&C review is expected to kick start by early 2012; BHCV WG will prepare a proposal document to EB on P&C review. SR will provide a template, RA will circulate and collect comments from all members, and the proposal will be presented during the next BHCV WG meeting. **Action: RA to collect proposal from members for P&C review**

4) Submission of time bound commitment for code of conduct implementation

SP briefed members that a resolution to request all RSPO members comply with the code of conduct and submit the time-bound action plan before RT11 was submitted, she seek all BHCV WG members to support this resolution.

5) HCV Compensation guideline and position statement

OT updated the BHCV WG members on development of the compensation guideline. The purpose of this project is to identify the crucial issues related to HCV compensation. Main findings of the compensation project including 8 principles for HCV compensation and different requirement for conversion conducted after Nov 2005-2007; Nov 2007-Dec 2009 and after Jan 2010.

In terms of conversion done by third party, it was accepted during the last meeting that only commercial conversion (despite any kind of agriculture crop) is required for compensation. Company who take over the land is responsible for HCV compensation despite the initial landuse.

MC reminded the group on the practicality of this proposal especially for growers from the rest of the world and the long term monitoring of the HCV compensation. In some cases, smallholders are clearing the land with expectation that the company will buy over the land. AL proposed to the group that a clearer definition on “commercial” conversion is required. MC agreed to AL’s idea and mentioned that there is a need to define the mechanism/ parties who will be responsible to draw the line between commercial and non-commercial conversion. AL agreed that this report is only the first step and we should decide on the role of the CTF.

SP asked whether this CTF’s proposal will change the P&C requirement as we are allowing compensation for HCV area after 2007. OT explained that EB has instructed CTF to look into the possibility of compensation mechanism after 2007 especially for new members who will join in future.

In terms of compensation without historical HCV assessment, CC asked how the company could and identifies the type of HCV lost. OT explained that for growers who volunteer to disclose area

converted without HHA can choose to compensate for the whole area but the types of compensation will need further elaboration.

6) SDP's Stage 2 Remediation Plan and stage 3 implementation

NH updated that the stage 2 report was accepted by the secretariat with several amendments suggested by BHCV WG. New timeline for HCV compensation was proposed and accepted by the secretariat. Stage 3 implementation is on-going.

RA questioned on the compensation actions and SP asked about the progress of the "golden triangle" zone which was identified as a proposed compensation site. NH will seek collaboration from other 2 companies i.e. Wilmar and GAR to implement the compensation actions around the "golden triangle" zone.

7) Quality of HCV assessment and consistency of HCV interpretation

AL highlighted 3 main challenges i.e. HCV interpretation, guideline on management and monitoring of the HCVA and capacity of the HCV assessors. Similar situations are encountered by other certification system such as FSC, RTRS and Bonsucro. AL presented on the different outcome from the HCV assessment in Kutai Barat by different organization.

RA stated the importance of CB's role in NPP process and the capacity of the team leader often affects the outcome of the assessment. He proposed RSPO to share the outcome of HCV assessment on a common platform.

MC questioned on effectiveness of HCV concept in conserving biodiversity. CC suggested BHCV WG to study the opportunity to protect the HCVAs.

CB proposed RSPO to conduct random reality check on the report findings and reports for high risk areas will need to be peer reviewed. AL suggested third party accreditation of HCV assessors by HCV RN to ensure capacity of the HCV assessors.

Action: AL, MC, DM, RA, MZ will jointly prepare an action plan for discussion at 16th BHCV WG meeting.

8) Contract on HCV training modules by HCV RN

SR mentioned that the ToR do not stress on the expected outcome from HCV RN but only highlights the processes. Besides the classroom lesson and test, BHCV WG proposed to include field training as part of the training module. Action: ALMF to incorporate the comments into the ToR.

9) Application of HCV assessors

ALMF updated that there are 53 applications in total and 23 was approved by the secretariat. Updated list was posted on the RSPO's website. CB will provide contact information to the secretariat for HCV experts based in Africa.



Roundtable on Sustainable Palm Oil

RSPO Secretariat Sdn Bhd
Company No.: 787510-K
Unit A-33A-2, Level 33A, Tower A
Menara UOA Bangsar,
No.5 Jln Bangsar Utama 1
59000 Kuala Lumpur
Malaysia

Telephone : +603-2302 1500/
Fax : +603 2201 4053
Email : rspo@rspo.org

For experts without experience in HCV assessment are required to demonstrate work with other approve HCV assessors and resubmit their application together with a copy of HCV assessment report.

10) AOB

16th BHCV WG meeting is scheduled on Feb 21st, 2012 coincide with the ICOPE meeting (Feb 22-24th), Bali

The meeting closed at 5.00 pm.

SP

Co-Chair

15th Meeting of Biodiversity and High Conservation Value (BHCV)

21st November 2011

Hotel Magellan, Kota Kinabalu

No.	Name	Organization	Signature
1.	Audrey Lee	RSPO	
2.	LAURA D'ARCY	ZSL	
3.	MARCUS COLCHESTER	FPP	
4.	Quirica TICHIT	SIBET	
5.	Gunung Gea	PanEco	
6.	Mohammad Tawier Mahdi	Member of Nch provincial Parliament	
7.	Coraean Ushie	PanEco	
8.	Anne Rosenbarger	WRI/sekala	
9.	Ariana Alijohbana	WRI	
10.	Rauf Prusaeljo	WRI	
11.	Darmawan Liswanto	FFI	
12.	DR STEPHEN BAUME	FFI - SINGAPORE	
13.	ANNA LYONS	FFI - SINGAPORE	
14.	MORAT MCEESH	WRI	
15.	Catherine CREVEILLIER CASSAGNE	IFC	
16.	Anders Lindhe	WWF Int	
17.	Beth Ungold	WRI	
18.	Asril Darussalam	RILB	
19.	oennis RUYSSCHAERT	PANECO	
20.	mohamad Pirabaharn	miramas sime Darby	
21.	Jibrailin Abdul Majid	miramas sime Darby (Indonesia)	



Roundtable on Sustainable Palm Oil

RSPO Secretariat Sdn Bhd
Company No.: 787510-K
Unit A-33A-2, Level 33A, Tower A
Menara UOA Bangsar,
No.5 Jln Bangsar Utama 1
59000 Kuala Lumpur
Malaysia

Telephone : +603-2302 1500/
Fax : +603 2201 4053
Email : rspo@rspo.org



Roundtable on Sustainable Palm Oil

RSPO Secretariat Sdn Bhd
Company No.: 787510-K
Unit A-33A-2, Level 33A, Tower A
Menara UOA Bangsar,
No.5 JlnBangsarUtama 1
59000 Kuala Lumpur
Malaysia

Telephone : +603-2302 1500/
Fax : +603 2201 4053
Email : rspo@rspo.org

22.	ADAM ABDUL HANIFF	SIME DARBY.	
23.	Cahyo Nugroho	FFI	
24.	ELIZABETH CLARKE	ZSL	
25.	Sinar S.	Wilmar	
26.	Stan Rogers	LFP	
27.	Dwi R. Mulyawan	Aksenta	
28.			
29.			
30.			
31.			
32.			
33.			
34.			
35.			
36.			
37.			
38.			
39.			
40.			



Roundtable on Sustainable Palm Oil

RSPO Secretariat Sdn Bhd
Company No.: 787510-K
Unit A-33A-2, Level 33A, Tower A
Menara UOA Bangsar,
No.5 Jln Bangsar Utama 1
59000 Kuala Lumpur
Malaysia

Telephone : +603-2302 1500/
Fax : +603 2201 4053
Email : rspo@rspo.org

Promoting consistent, high-quality HCV assessments

BHCV WG 2011-11-21

Challenges (1):

- Common **interpretations** of the HCV definitions across all users in line with the global (FSC / HCV RN) definitions:
 - What are HCVs / HCVAs, HCVMAAs etc?
 - What does each specific HVC (1-6) stand for?
- Common, standardised procedures for **identification** and **assessments** of HCVs across all users (additional national adaptation / toolkits where necessary)

Challenges (2):

- Clear guidance on **maintenance** and **monitoring** of HCVs adapted to scheme requirements, commodity contexts and scheme standards:
 - Scope for collaboration between schemes but outputs likely to be scheme-specific
- Qualified HCV assessors:
 - Quality criteria, training programs
 - Effective monitoring / licensing

Interpretation challenges – ID examples

- The ID toolkit have 3 categories of HCV 2 – none of them fully consistent with the global def
- Unclarities around the value of fragments (HCV3)
- Generally, the ID 'bar' seems to be lower than the global definitions

Comments to the maps:

- These are desktop identifications of potential HCVs – probably less differences in field assessments of real, site-specific HCVs
- The intention is not to suggest what's right or wrong – just to highlight discrepancies and to demonstrate that the existing guidance is inadequate

Some issues

- Assessors regard almost every area / fragment of natural forest as HCV
- Reconciling that with realities of plantation expansion / economic development leads to:
 - a view among that some that 'not all HCVs need to be maintained to their full extent' – reputational risks, especially problematic for HCV2
 - Risks for adapting / negotiating identification of HCVs to what's 'realistic' / 'feasible' to maintain

Recommendations

(Largely based on Daemeter draft final report)

- Clarify role of HCV concept vs. other provisions / safeguards, e.g. best practises (RSPO standard)
- RSPO should collaborate with HCVNI, HCV RN and FSC to revise and create common toolkit on HCV identification and assessment – including interpretation of HCV definitions (ID HCV toolkit)
- Design a process to finalise RSPO guidance on management and monitoring

- Develop quality criteria for HCV assessors, including code of conduct
- Put in place a system for independent monitoring of HCV assessors' performance in relation of the criteria – RSPO could be pilot for global approach

- Design a standardised template for concise HCV reporting that fits with the peer review process
- Require peer reviews – at least for larger operations in high risk areas
- Make summaries of assessments publicly available

Summary of urgent issues to be addressed

- Common, updated guidance /toolkit on HCV identification and assessment
- Elaborated guidance on maintenance and monitoring
- Quality control of assessors